

ATTACHMENT D



PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

STAFF REPORT

DATE: DECEMBER 17, 2024

TO: HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

FROM: JENNIFER PAIGE, AICP, DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

SUBJECT: APPLICATION FOR AMENDMENTS TO THE BUNGALOW HEAVEN LANDMARK DISTRICT CONSERVATION PLAN

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the Historic Preservation Commission:

1. Find that the designation of a historic resource is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA Guidelines Section 15308: Class 8 - Actions by Regulatory Agencies for Protection of the Environment) and that there are no features that distinguish this project from others in the exempt class and, therefore, there are no unusual circumstances;
2. Find that the proposed Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan, as amended in Attachment A, meets the criteria for amendment to a conservation plan, (Pasadena Municipal Code (PMC) Section 17.62.070.H.5), specifically:
 - a. The proposed amendments are consistent with the purposes of this Chapter; and
 - b. The proposed amendments are in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan; and
 - c. The proposed amendments would not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or general welfare of the City.
3. Recommend that the City Council approve the amendments to the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan as shown in Attachment A.

BACKGROUND:

On November 16, 2023, the Bungalow Heaven Neighborhood Association submitted an application for Eligibility Review of the amendments to the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan. Staff conducted an informational meeting which was noticed to all property owners within the district boundary, on June 20, 2024.

The staff evaluated the amendments according to the landmark district/conservation plan amendment criteria in PMC Section 17.62.070.H.5 and on July 1, 2024, issued a Notice of Decision that determined that the amendments meet the applicable criteria for approval.

On July 10, 2024, two formal appeals were filed by two Bungalow Heaven residents and the Historic Preservation Commission heard the appeals on October 1, 2024. The Commission voted to deny the appeals and uphold staff's eligibility determination.

On October 15, 2024, the Bungalow Heaven Neighborhood Association initiated the Formal Review of the amendments to the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan. Staff has reviewed the material submitted and confirmed that the amendments meet the applicable criteria for approval, as described below.

DESCRIPTION OF THE CONSERVATION PLAN AMENDMENTS:

The proposed amendments to the Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan include:

Period of Significance: The established period of significance for the Bungalow Heaven Landmark District, as stated in the Conservation Plan and designation report, is "the turn of the century through the 1930s." The proposed amendments will more clearly define and extend the period of significance to be from 1885 to 1956. This extended period of significance will capture the last significant wave of development for the district. There are no proposed changes to the existing landmark district boundaries. See Attachment B for the applicant's justification of the period of significance expansion.

Contributing and Non-Contributing Status: There is not a current formal list of contributing and non-contributing properties within the landmark district boundaries. The proposed Conservation Plan amendments include a complete list of all properties within the established boundaries indicating contributing and non-contributing statuses based on the updated period of significance. See Attachment C for full list of contributing and non-contributing statuses.

Pro Forma and Terminology Updates: The Conservation Plan amendments also include proposed updates to capture the 2004 expansion of the landmark district and to make the plan consistent with the 2021 revision to the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance. See Attachment D for a redlined version of the proposed Conservation Plan changes.

ANALYSIS:

Pursuant to PMC Section 17.62.070.H, the procedures for amending a Landmark District or Conservation Plan shall follow the same procedures for designating a new Landmark District. As such, pursuant to PMC Section 17.62.070.C, the Historic Preservation Commission's role in reviewing Conservation Plan Amendments is to determine whether the Conservation Plan Amendment meets the criteria for designation as specified in PMC Section 17.62.070.H, which states that the following criteria shall apply to amendment of a conservation plan:

- a. The proposed amendments are consistent with the purposes of this Chapter; and
- b. The proposed amendments are in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan; and
- c. The proposed amendments would not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or general welfare of the City.

The proposed amendments are consistent with the purposes of PMC Section 17.62.070.H and in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan, in that they will allow for updates to bring the plan into greater consistency with the updated Historic Preservation Ordinance, which furthers the preservation efforts of the City. The proposed expansion to the period of significance will ensure that all of the buildings that represent the full historical development pattern of the district are protected and inclusion of a formal list of contributing and non-contributing structures would provide definitive status information for Staff to use when evaluating and reviewing projects and will ensure that property owners are more aware of requirements and guidelines that will apply to their properties. In addition, the proposed amendments would not be detrimental to the public interest, health, safety, convenience, or general welfare of the City because they will further ensure protection of all of the resources that make up the Bungalow Heaven Landmark District, the designation of which was supported by a majority of the property owners in the district. Based on this analysis, staff finds that the proposed amendments meet the criteria for approval.

RESULTS OF DESIGNATION:

Landmark District designation protects the historic and architectural character of a neighborhood by requiring submittal and review by the Historic Preservation Commission or Design & Historic Preservation staff of an application for Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior changes that are visible from the street. Demolitions, relocations and new construction are also reviewed in landmark districts. Reviews of alterations and demolitions of non-contributing structures are required, as well as of contributing structures; however, according to the guidelines, more changes are permitted on non-contributing structures because they have few, if any, features that need to be preserved.

Guidelines: The *Design Guidelines for Historic Districts* apply to reviews of all projects in residential landmark and historic districts. These guidelines, developed with the participation of local residents, are an elaboration of the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* and have examples and illustrations targeting local conditions.

CONCLUSION

Based on this analysis, the proposed Bungalow Heaven Conservation Plan Amendments meet all of the necessary criteria for approval. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the City Council approve the proposed Conservation Plan Amendments.

Respectfully Submitted,



Jennifer Paige, AICP
Director of Planning & Community
Development Department

Prepared by:



Stephanie Cisneros
Senior Planner

Reviewed by:



Kevin Johnson
Principal Planner

Attachments:

- A. Map of Existing Landmark District
- B. Proposed Amendment Narrative
- C. List of Contributing and Non-Contributing Properties
- D. Proposed Conservation Plan Amendments (Redlined Version)