

#### PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

#### STAFF REPORT

DATE: DECEMBER 7, 2022

TO: PLANNING COMMISSION

**FROM:** JENNIFER PAIGE, ACTING DIRECTOR OF PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

**SUBJECT:** MAYFIELD JUNIOR SCHOOL MASTER PLAN 405 S EUCLID AVENUE

#### **RECOMMENDATION:**

It is recommended that the Planning Commission, following a public hearing, recommend that the City Council:

- 1. Find that the proposed Master Plan is exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the State California Environmental Quality Act, Sections 15302 Replacement or Reconstruction and 15314: Minor Addition to Schools;
- 2. Make the findings in Attachment A and approve the Mayfield Junior School Master Plan, with the conditions of approval in Attachment B;
- 3. Make the findings in Attachment A and adopt a General Plan Diagram Amendment to change the land use designation of the property located at 364 Waldo Avenue from Medium High Density Residential (0-32 dwelling units per acre) to Institutional; and
- Make the findings in Attachment A and adopt a Zoning Map Amendment to change the zoning designation of the properties located at 373 S. Euclid Avenue and 364 Waldo Avenue from Residential Multi-Family, 0-32 Units per Acre, Height Limit 36 feet (RM-32-HL-36) to Public and Semi-Public (PS).

### BACKGROUND:

The applicant, Berliner Architects for Mayfield Junior School, is applying for a Master Plan for a 10-year, phased development program for the Mayfield Junior School. The purpose of the Master Plan is to address on-site parking needs and facility modernization, including additional underground parking, upgrading the athletic field and play areas, reconstruction of the library building and middle school building, and renovation of the elementary school building. The project would allow the school to provide additional programming, including art, music and science programs, and reduce the student-to-teacher ratio in the classroom.

The application also includes a General Plan Diagram Amendment to change the land use designation of the property located at 364 Waldo Avenue from Medium High Density Residential (0-32 dwelling units per acre) to Institutional and a Zoning Map Amendment to change the zoning designation of the properties located at 373 S. Euclid Avenue and 364 Waldo Avenue from RM-32 HL-36 (Residential Multi-Family, 0-32 Units per Acre, Height Limit 36 feet) to PS (Public and Semi-Public).

#### Location and Setting

The existing Mayfield School campus is located in the south-central portion of the city at 405 South Euclid Avenue; the project site comprises a half city block bounded by East Bellevue Drive to the south, Waldo Avenue to the West, and South Euclid Avenue to the East. The campus is approximately 4.16 acres or 181,437 square feet and developed with six academic and administrative buildings and an underground parking garage. The main campus is accessible from Euclid Avenue however there are additional entrances off of Waldo Avenue and Bellevue Drive. The campus is bounded by RM-32 HL-36 properties to the north, east, and south, and Planned Development 13 (PD-13), a mixed-use office and multi-family residential development, to the west. The property is currently located in the Central District Specific Plan, In-Town Housing Subdistrict.

#### Site History

Mayfield Junior School of the Holy Child Jesus was established in 1931 at its current location on Euclid Avenue. Initially, the campus included a small classroom/administration building and gymnasium that were designed and constructed by J.J. Buckley & Sons. Throughout the 1930s and 1940s the school grew, and classrooms were added onto the existing school buildings. In 1957, the present Elementary Building (Building "D") was completed. In 1967, additional property was purchased for further campus expansion. In 1969, some of the older classrooms were demolished for the construction of the Junior Building (now known as the Hayden Building, Building "B"). In 1977, facilities were constructed to house the kindergarten and development offices. An addition to the auditorium was built in 1981. A storage building housing the custodian's and physical education offices became part of the campus in 1982. The Pike Resource Center/ Library (Building "C") was completed in early 1983. In 1988, the administration offices of the Junior Building were remodeled and expanded and renamed to the Hayden Building. The campus expanded further with the construction of a multi-purpose/gymnasium building in 1998. Previous zoning cases on this property include:

• <u>Variance # 5517</u>: To allow an 8-foot chain link fence along the property line for playground (approved July 10, 1958).

- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 341:</u> To allow construction of a two-story classroom and administration building (approved June 9, 1966).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 1182:</u> To allow construction of a Learning Resource Center in an existing school (approved March 4, 1981).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 1278:</u> To allow a car garage and storage structure (approved August 18, 1982).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 1601:</u> To allow expansion of an existing private school by addition of administrative offices and a classroom. A Variance was granted allowing no additional parking (approved June 4, 1986).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 3153:</u> To allow construction of a new multi-purpose building, a new parking lot, a new gymnasium, renovations of existing science laboratories, and relocation or demolition of two existing residential units (approved June 19, 1996).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit # 3860:</u> To allow the construction of nine new classrooms (singlestory 7,840 square feet), a new auditorium (4,940 square feet) above a new parking structure (43 parking spaces) and storage space in the basement, on the southeast corner of the property and to expand the enrollment capacity to 540 students (Approved November 27, 2001).
- <u>Conditional Use Permit #6585</u>: To allow the demolition of an existing 897 square-foot campus chapel and reconstruction of a new 1,664 square-foot chapel in the same location in order to accommodate existing student enrollment. The project also includes the removal of six parking spaces, restriping the parking lot and reconfiguration of the existing drop-off and pick-up area and drive aisle (Approved April 18, 2018).

# **PROJECT DESCRIPTION:**

The proposed project is a 10-year, four-phase Master Plan for Mayfield Junior School. No increase in student enrollment is proposed; the existing permitted enrollment capacity would remain at 540 students. The number of staff/faculty would increase from 89 to 105. The proposed project would result in a net increase of 42,856 square feet upon completion of the final phase. The proposed gross floor area of the campus would be 114,053 square feet at buildout. The project is phased as follows:

### Phase 1 (1 – 2.5 year construction):

Phase 1 of the Project, proposed for the southwest portion of the campus, would demolish the existing 38,831 square-foot grass athletic field to facilitate extension of an existing 1,800 square-foot underground parking area (Building "G") by 32,436 square feet and the construction of new artificial turf field and fencing, located on top of the new underground parking extension. The extended underground parking area would consist of 79 new parking stalls and four storage closet spaces. This phase would also include one loading space in the Northern Parking Lot, accessible from Waldo Avenue. A new 10'x6' LED scoreboard is proposed for the athletic field, on the northern end. It would be 16ft high and located immediately adjacent to a wrought iron fence that separates the field from the playground.

### Phase 2 (1 year construction):

Phase 2 of the Project, located centrally in the campus, involves the demolition of the existing 6,826 square-foot Library Building (Building "C"), and 24,819 square feet of existing landscape around the library. In its place, a new 20,025 square-foot Center for Teaching and Learning building (Building "H") would be constructed and 24,991 square feet of new landscaping and playground would be installed. The Center for Teaching and Learning is a two-story building that would include four classrooms, the servery/lunch distribution area, offices, the lower and middle school libraries, and storage spaces. A 5,430 square-foot expansion to the existing underground basement level would be added to the Gymnasium (Building "A"). An existing outdoor basketball court would be demolished and reconstructed in the same location. The gymnasium addition would include three new classrooms, one ADA restroom, two office spaces, storage and two art studio spaces.

## Phase 3 (6-month construction):

Phase 3 of the Project, proposed on the east portion of the campus, is interior and exterior renovation of the existing 8,120 square-foot Elementary Building (Building "D") and construction of a new 960 square-foot Entry Pavilion addition to the Elementary Building. The scope consists of renovating six existing classrooms and converting existing meeting rooms into office spaces for the administration; no additional classrooms are proposed during this phase. The new Entry Pavilion would serve as the front desk and reception for the administration. This phase also includes demolition of 5,401 square feet of existing landscape and walkway area to facilitate construction of 4,441 square feet of new landscape and walkway area.

## Phase 4 (1.5 years construction):

Phase 4 of the Project, proposed on the north portion of the campus, includes demolition of the existing 17,233 square-foot Hayden Building (Building "B") and 43,071 square feet of adjacent landscape, walkway, 21 parking spaces and driveway area to facilitate construction of the new 40,500 square-foot Middle School Building (Building "I") and 32,946 square feet of landscape, walkway, and parking/loading area. The new three-story Middle School building would consist of basement with storage, electrical, and mechanical equipment, seven classrooms each on the first and second floor and four classrooms on the third floor of the building. The removal of the existing 21 parking spaces off of Euclid Avenue would be relocated in the new subterranean parking garage, three parking spaces would remain off of the Euclid Avenue entrance.

At completion of the phased Master Plan, there would be a net increase of 42,856 square feet of gross floor area added to the campus with 46 total classrooms, a net increase of 10. The Table 1 summarizes the changes to the campus that are proposed by the Master Plan:

Facility	Existing Building Sq. Ft.	Proposed Building Sq. Ft.	Phase
Building "A"	13,637 sq. ft.	22,093 sq. ft	Phase 2
Gymnasium			
Building "B"	17,233 sq. ft.	Demolish/ Replaced by Middle	Phase 4
Hayden Building		School Building	
Building "C"	6,826 sq. ft.	Demolish/ Replaced by Center	Phase 2
Pike Learning Center/Library		for Learning and Teaching	
Building "D"	8,120 sq. ft.	9,080 sq. ft.	Phase 3
Elementary Building			
Building "E"	4,876 sq. ft.	No Change	N/A
Performing Arts Center			
Building "F"	12,279 sq. ft.	No Change	N/A
Primary Center and Connelly Hall		_	
Building "G"	1,800 sq. ft.	8,049 sq. ft. (gross floor area)	Phase 1
Basement Parking Below Primary	-	34,236 (total square feet)	
Center			
Building "H"	N/A	20,025 sq. ft.	Phase 2
Center for Teaching and Learning			
Building "l"	N/A	40,500 sq. ft.	Phase 4
Middle School Building			
Total Gross Floor Area	71,197 sq. ft.	114,053 sq. ft.	
	•	42,856 sq. ft. (net new)	

### ANALYSIS:

The purpose of a Master Plan, as detailed in Section 17.61.050.1 of the Zoning Code, is to establish a procedure that reduces processing time and uncertainty by consolidating several Conditional Use Permit (CUP) hearings over an extended period of time, as well as to ensure orderly and thorough City review of expansion plans for certain public, semi-public, and open space uses, resulting in more compatible and desirable development. While the City Council is the decision-making body for a Master Plan, the Design and Planning Commissions act as advisory bodies and make recommendations to the City Council.

For projects in the PS zoning district, the development standards, such as floor area, height, and setback requirements are specified under a CUP or Master Plan. Further, a Master Plan outlines the type and locations of uses, the amount of new development, the amount and location of parking, the maximum height and minimum setbacks for new structures, and other details and features of a project for a specific period of time.

For properties in the PS zoning district, the development standards are established through a CUP or Master Plan. The Master Plan proposes the following development standards:

Table 3 DEVELOPM	ΕΝΤ STAN						
	Building "A' Gymnasiun	Building "D"	Building "E" Performing Arts Center	Building "F" Primary Center and Connelly Hall	Building "G" Basement Parking Below Primary Center	Building "H" Center for Teaching and Learning	Building "I" <i>Middle</i> School Building
Setback (min	imum)						
Existing	19'-7" from West Property Line	19'-5" from East Property Line	19'-4" from East Property Line	20'-1" from South Property Line	19'-5" from East Property Line	N/A	N/A
Proposed	No Change	No Change	No Change	No Change	No Change	Interior Building	20'-1" from East Property Line
Height (maxir	num)						
Existing	36'-7"	20'-7"	27'-9"	31'-2"	0'	N/A	N/A
Proposed	No Change	nange No Change No Change		No Change	No Change	32'-0"	42'-6"
Gross Floor A							
Net Increase							
Total			feet				
Floor Area Ra		0.72					
Fence/ Wall H		num)		1			
School Perimeter fence			6 feet				
CMU Wall along north property line			6 feet				
Fence at athletic field along Bellevue and Waldo Avenue			8 feet				
Fence at basketball court along Waldo Avenue			16 feet				
		and athletic field	1	16 feet			
Parking Requ							
	Parking Spaces 122						
Loading Spaces 1							
Bicycle Parkin	3	20					
		or Area Require					
	assroom Space 12,960 square feet (24 sq. ft./student)						
Outdoor Area	Dutdoor Area40,500 square feet (75 sq. ft./student)						

### Parking

Currently, there are 99 available parking spaces, consisting of 39 spaces in the north parking lot, 43 spaces in the garage, and 13 spaces provided off-site at 181 East California Boulevard. Event parking is limited to the on-site parking availability. Increased available of parking spaces would alleviate the congestion of on-street public parking during events.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 17.46.040, for grammar schools, 1.5 parking spaces shall be provided per classroom, plus one space for every 2 employees and members of the faculty. The proposed Master Plan includes a classroom increase from 36 to 46 classrooms, and an increase in staffing, from 89 to 105. For 46 classrooms and 105 staff members, the school is

required to provide a total of 122 parking spaces for the operation of the school. The proposed Master Plan would provide 126 parking spaces on-site.

Pursuant to Zoning Code Section 17.46.260, for Public and Semi-Public (PS) land uses, if the total gross floor area is over 20,000 square feet, one loading space is required for every 20,000 sq ft, not to exceed six spaces. There is one existing off-street loading space on campus, located in the North parking lot. The increase of the school's gross floor area would require an additional two loading spaces, for a total of three loading spaces, however per PMC Section 17.26.040.B, in the PS Zone, development standards are specified through the Master Plan process. The proposed Master Plan maintains one off-street loading space. There is no anticipated increase to the loading or unloading of passengers or goods as student enrollment is not proposed to change.

Pursuant to Zoning Section 17.46.320, bicycle parking spaces for Public, Semi-Public Uses are established by a Conditional Use Permit. Prior conditional use permits for this site did not include bicycle parking requirements. There are currently six bicycle parking spaces located near the Hayden Building (Building "B"). The proposed Master Plan includes 14 additional bicycle parking spaces in the parking garage.

## Classroom Space/Outdoor Area:

Zoning Code Section 17.50.270 requires a certain amount of classroom space and outdoor area be provided for students. For classroom space, 24 square feet minimum of indoor classroom area shall be required for each student enrolled, therefore, 12,960 square feet is required for 540 students whereas 35,754 square feet would be provided at the completion of Phase 4. For outdoor areas, 75 square feet minimum of outdoor play area shall be provided for each student enrolled, therefore, 40,500 square feet is required for 540 students whereas 46,827 square feet would be provided at the completion of Phase 2.

# General Plan and Zoning Designations:

The Mayfield Junior School comprises of five contiguous parcels. Four out of five of these parcels are designated as Institutional in the General Plan. 364 Waldo Avenue, which is currently used as a parking lot by the school, is designated as Medium High Density Residential (MHDR). Three out of five parcels are located in the Public and Semi-Public (PS) Zone; 373 S. Euclid Avenue and 364 Waldo Avenue, both currently used as parking lots, are located in the Residential Multi-Family, 0-32 Units per Acre, Height Limit 36 feet (RM-32-HL-36) Zone.

The application includes a General Plan Amendment to change 364 Waldo Avenue from MHDR to Institutional and a Zoning Map Amendment to change 373 S. Euclid Avenue and 364 Waldo Avenue from RM-32-HL-36 Zone to the PS Zone.

The General Plan Institutional land use designation is intended for public and quasi-public entities such as civic, educational, cultural, and/or religious facilities. The existing, private primary (K-8) school use would be consistent with the Institutional land use designation of the General Plan. The Medium High Density Residential land use designation is generally characterized by medium-high density multi-family complexes with one- to three-story buildings. While private school uses may be permitted with a Conditional Use Permit in the corresponding RM-32 zoning district, the Institutional land use designation and the PS zoning would be more appropriate in this instance, especially for a private school with a proposed Master Plan.

Table 2 - EXISTING AND PROPOSED DESIGNATIONS							
Address	Gene	eral Plan	Zoning				
Address	Existing	Proposed	Existing	Proposed			
405 S. Euclid Avenue	Institutional	No Change	PS	No Change			
402 Waldo Avenue	Institutional	No Change	PS	No Change			
380 Waldo Avenue	Institutional	No Change	PS	No Change			
373 S. Euclid Avenue	Institutional	No Change	RM-32 HL-36	PS			
364 Waldo Avenue	MHDR	Institutional	RM-32 HL-36	PS			

#### TREE PROTECTION ORDINANCE:

The Tree Protection Ordinance requires protection of public trees and trees on private property of certain size. The six types of trees protected by the City's Tree Protection Ordinance include public, landmark, landmark-eligible, specimen, mature, and native trees. There are currently 140 private trees on campus, five of which are protected, four private trees located off-site, overhanging the property line, and 29 public trees. The new development proposes the removal of 15 private trees on campus, none of which are protected. No public trees or protected trees are proposed to be removed.

The applicant has submitted a preliminary landscaping plan to show the general location of replacement trees and new landscaping on the Master Plan site. The preliminary landscaping plan emphasizes a tree canopy that is sustainable over the long term. A condition of approval is included, which requires the applicant to submit a final landscaping plan.

### **GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY:**

Most of the parcels that make up the Mayfield Junior School campus are designated as Institutional on the Land Use Diagram of the General Plan's Land Use Element. The Institutional land use category applies to uses that can be, "characterized by facilities owned and operated by the City or by other public and/or private institutions such as corporate yards, schools, libraries, and hospitals." The Mayfield Junior School has been an established private school institution in the City since 1931. The request to change the General Plan Designation of 324 Waldo Avenue from MHDR to the Institutional land use designation would be more appropriate in this instance, since this parcel is used by the existing educational institution. This amendment would reaffirm the City's commitment to provide a diverse educational system responsive to the needs of the community, including the General Plan Land Use Element:

**GOAL 17 Educational System** - A strong and diverse educational system that is responsive to the life-long needs of the community and related to maintaining a high quality of life and a strong economy.

General Plan Policy 17.4, Long-Range Planning for Private Schools, requires private schools to collaborate with the City on site selection, site design, traffic control, circulation and site acquisition to ensure compatibility with the neighborhoods or districts in which they are located. The proposed Master Plan is a Master Conditional Use Permit that outlines Mayfield Junior School's proposed development for the next 10 years; additionally, the school has been established in its current location since 1931, therefore, the continued use of the project site as a private school is consistent with the General Plan, as further discussed in detail in attached Findings (Attachment A).

### COMMUNITY MEETING:

As part of the City's Master Plan application process, neighbors within a 500 square foot radius of the project were invited to participate in a virtual community meeting on August 31, 2022. The community meeting included a presentation by Planning staff and the applicant, questions and comments from the public, and the opportunity for one-on-one discussions between community members, and City and Mayfield Junior staff and the project architect.

## DESIGN COMMISSION ADVISORY REVIEW:

On November 8, 2022, the Design Commission conducted an Advisory Review of the proposed 10-year, four-phase Master Plan of the Mayfield Junior School located at 405 South Euclid Avenue. Pursuant to PMC Section 17.61.050.I.3.f, the Design Commission shall conduct an Advisory Review on a Master Plan and make a recommendation to the Planning Commission and City Council. Pursuant to PMC Section 17.61.030.I.5.b, the role of the Design Commission for projects proposing new Master Plans shall be focused on recommendations to the Planning Commission and the City Council on aesthetics, urban design issues related to architecture, landscaping, site plan, and historic preservation.

The Design Commission generally concurred with staff's analysis that the proposed Master Plan presented no outstanding design-related issues under the topics noted above and that the proposed Master Plan is consistent with the applicable design guidelines as proposed. The Commission provided the following recommendations:

Design Commission Comments:

- 1. Provide a comparative before and after exhibit of the Master Plan indicating the existing site conditions and the proposed completed construction of the built-out Master Plan.
- 2. Maintain a clear labeling and orientation of plans with north arrows for future reviews.
- 3. Clearly indicate vehicular circulation patterns of the existing and proposed off-site and onsite conditions indicating vehicular entry points, drop off zones, and parking areas.

### ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW:

A CEQA analysis was conducted for the project and has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Public Resources Code §21080(b)(9); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, Sections 15302, Class 2 (Replacement or Reconstruction) and 15314, Class 14 (Minor Additions to Schools).

Section 15302, Class 2 (Replacement or Reconstruction) specifically exempts from environmental review where the project consists of replacement or reconstruction of existing structures and facilities where the new structure would be located on the same site as the structure replaced and would have substantially the same purpose and capacity as the structure replaced, including replacement or reconstruction of existing schools and hospitals to provide earthquake resistant structures which do not increase capacity more than 50 percent. The proposed project would not increase capacity more than 50 percent, as student enrollment is not proposed to increase.

Section 15314, Class 14 (Minor Additions to Schools) specifically exempts from environmental review where the addition does not increase original student capacity by more than 25% or ten classrooms, whichever is less. The proposed project does not increase the capacity of school by more than 25% since student enrollment is not proposed to increase. The proposed project increases the number of classrooms from 36 to 46, under the threshold to warrant environmental review.

## Historic Preservation

The campus underwent a Historical Resource Evaluation (HRE), conducted by ESA Associates and confirmed by staff of the Design & Historic Preservation Section in a decision dated June 27, 2022. According to the evaluation, the original building, Connelly Hall, is the only building that has been identified as an eligible historical resource. The building was originally constructed as a two-story single-family residence for DuBois and Jessica Knight, in 1917. The building was designed by Frohman and Martin in the Colonial Revival architectural style and constructed by C.M. Hansen and Son. The building was purchased in 1931 by the Catholic Church and served as the convent for the new school site. In 2002, the building was moved approximately 65 feet to the east to align with the campus buildings along South Euclid Avenue. During this time, a new classroom wing, and two-story addition were constructed, following the Secretary of the Interior Standards. The HRE determined that the Connelly Hall building is individually eligible as a historic resource under the National Register criterion of A/1, the California Register criterion of C/3, and locally as a Pasadena Landmark under criteria 2.a. and 2.c due to its extant integrity from its period of significance. The building has been assigned the National Register of Historic Places status codes of 3S (national), 3CS (California), and 5S3 (local) to correspond to this determination.

The proposed Master Plan does not propose any alterations or expansions to the historically eligible Connelly Hall building. Alterations are proposed for the adjacent Elementary Building; however, there is a sizable separation between the two buildings and the intervening Building E is proposed to remain unaltered. Any proposed alteration to the Connelly Hall building, or campus construction that has potential impacts to the structure would be required to follow the Secretary of the Interior Standards to ensure the building's continued protection.

# **REVIEW BY OTHER DEPARTMENTS:**

The proposed project was reviewed by the Department of Public Works, Department of Transportation, Water Division from the Water & Power Department, Power Division from the Water & Power Department, Fire Department, Building and Safety Division, and Design and Historic Preservation Section of Planning Division. Comments received from the departments are incorporated as conditions of approval in Attachment B.

The Department of Transportation has reviewed the proposed project based on the thresholds outlined in the Traffic Impact Review Guidelines and determined a traffic analysis was not required because there would be no increase in student population. The Department of Transportation determined that no changes are required to the existing traffic management plan, based on the scope of the proposed project, that was approved by the Department of Transportation for CUP #3860 (Attachment F). The school will continue to be required to submit annual compliance reports for the traffic management plan to the Department of Transportation as required by condition #30.

#### CONCLUSION:

The proposed Master Plan outlines the proposed development for Mayfield Junior School for the next 10 years. Conditions of approval related to the maximum number of student enrollment, staff and faculty, the amount, height, and location of new buildings, as well as parameters on the operation and programming of the school have been included to ensure the compatibility of the institutional use with nearby single-family residential uses. The Conditions of Approval are contained in Attachment B. These conditions consolidate the relevant existing conditions from previous Conditional Use Permit approvals as well as add new conditions to minimize any potential impact from the school's expansion.

Respectfully Submitted,

Jennifer D. Paige, AICP Acting Director of Planning & Community Development

Prepared by:

anio. Hall.

Melanie Hall Associate Planner

Reviewed by:

David Sanchez Principal Planner

Attachments (6):

Attachment A: Findings – Master Plan, General Plan Amendment, Zoning Map Amendment

Attachment B: Conditions of Approval

Attachment C: Project Plans – Existing and Proposed by Phase

Attachment D: Proposed General Plan Diagram Amendment: 364 Waldo Avenue

Attachment E: Proposed Zone Map Amendment: 373 South Euclid Avenue and 364 Waldo Avenue Attachment F: Approved Traffic Control Plan