



# PLANNING DIVISION MASTER APPLICATION FORM

Project Address:	171 2,	Grand avenue	
Project Name:	The i	Shake speare	Club
Project Description:			tions, or
Zoning Designation:		General Plan Des	ignation:
Valuation (Cost of P			
, <u></u>	The Sha Grand Sta Phyllis Crange Sta AME: The Sta Chand Sta	te: CA zip: 9/105  te: CA zip: 9/105  te: CA zip: 9/105  te: CA zip: 9/105  PROVALS REQUIRED (Mark cle	Garly the type of approval(s) required);
ADJUSTMENT		HEIGHT AVERAGING	PREDEVELOPMENT PLAN REVIEW
AFFORDABLE CONCESSION	\ /	HILLSIDE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT	RELIEF FROM THE REPLACEMENT BUILDING PERMIT REQUIREMENT
CERTIFICATE (		HISTORIC DESIGNATION (MONUMENT LANDMARK, TREE OR SIGN) HISTORICAL RESEARCH/EVALUATION	SIGN EXCEPTION TENTATIVE PARCEL/TRACT MAP
CHANGES TO A PROJECT	APPROVED	LANDMARK TREE PRUNING	TEMP. CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT
CONDITIONAL	USE PERMIT	MASTER DEVELOPMENT PLAN	TREE PROTECTION PLAN REVIEW
DESIGN REVIE	w	MASTER SIGN PLAN	TREE REMOVAL
DEVELOPMEN	TAGREMENT	MINOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT	VARIANCE
EXPRESSIVE L	JSE PERMIT	MINOR VARIANCE	VARIANCE FOR HISTORIC RESOURCES
FLOOR AREA F INCREASE	RATIO (FAR)	PLANNED DEVELOPMENT ZONE	ZONE CHANGE (MAP AMENDMENT)
GENERAL PLA	N AMENDMENT	PRELIMINARY PLAN CHECK	OTHER:

Note: Space for signature is on reverse side

#### INDEMNIFICATION

Applicant agrees to defend, indemnify, and hold harmless the City and its officers, contractors, consultants, employees, and commission members (collectively, "City") from any and all liability, loss, suits, claims, damages, costs, judgments and expenses (including attorney's fees and costs of litigation), including any appeals thereto (collectively, "proceeding") brought against the City with regard to any approvals issued in connection with the application(s) by the City, including any action taken pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act. If Applicant is required to defend the City in connection with such proceeding, the City shall have and retain the right to approve counsel to so defend the City; and all significant decisions concerning the manner in which the defense is conducted; and any and all settlements, which approval shall not be unreasonably withheld. The City shall also have and retain the right to not participate in the defense, except that the City agrees to reasonably cooperate with Applicant in the defense of the proceeding. If the City's Attorney's Office participates in the defense, all City Attorney fees and costs shall be paid by Applicant. Further, Applicant agrees to defend, indemnify and hold harmless the City from and for all costs and fees incurred in additional investigation or study of, or for supplementing, revising, or amending, any document if made necessary by said proceeding.

#### **CERTIFICATION:**

I hereby certify that I am the applicant or designated agent named herein and that I am familiar with the rules and regulations with respect to preparing and filing this petition for discretionary action, and that the statements and answers contained herein and the information attached are in all respects true and accurate to the best of my knowledge and belief.

SIGNATURE OF APPLICANT OR AGENT: Clerch Gland Date: 147/207						
For Office Use Only  PLN#  CASE #  PRJ #  DATE ACCEPTED: 12 (0 2   DATE SUBMITTALS RECEIVED: RECEIVED BY (INITIALS):  FEES: BASE FEE:: 3% RECORDS FEE: \$ TOTAL: HISTORIC ARCH. RESEARCH REQUIRED? YES NO PUBLIC ART REVIEW REQUIRED? TRANSPORTATION REVIEW REQUIRED? INCLUSIONARY HOUSING REQUIRED? YES NO YES NO	REVIEW AUTHORITY:  STAFF  HEARING OFFICER  PLANNING COMMISSION/BZA  DESIGN COMMISSION  HISTORIC PRESERVATION  COMMISSION  CITY COUNCIL.  TAXPAYER PROTECTION  DISCLOSURE REQUIRED  NOT REQUIRED	CEQA REVIEW:    ÉXEMPTION   INITIAL STUDY   EIR   CEQA REVIEW STATUS:   PENDING   COMPLETED	Design & Historic Preservation:  TYPE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW: □ CATEGORY 1 (DESIGNATED) □ CATEGORY 2 (ELIGIBLE)  LANDMARK/HISTORIC DISTRICT NAME: □ TYPE OF DESIGN/REVIEW: □ CONCEPT □ FINAL □ CONSOLIDATED □ PRELIMINARY CONSULTATION			



# Supplemental Application for HISTORIC DESIGNATION

Note: In addition to this application, a completed Planning Division Master Application Form is also required.

# PROPERTY PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION The Shakespeare Club 1. Name of Property: 171 S. Grand Avenue 2. Property Address: 3. Date of Original Construction 1928 4. Original Owner Josephine P. Everett Architect / Builder: Marston & Maybury DESIGNATION CATEGORY (CHECK APPROPRIATE BOX-SEE CRITERIA ON PAGES 2 & 3 FOR MORE INFORMATION): ✓ HISTORIC MONUMENT **LANDMARK** HISTORIC SIGN LANDMARK TREE BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY Briefly describe the property proposed for designation, indicating whether the entire site or a portion of the site is the subject of the nomination (e.g., how many buildings or objects on the site are included in the nomination) or if the nomination is for an object, sign or tree. A map may be used for the description. Please also submit recent and, if available, historical photographs. Use additional sheets if necessary. Itialian Renaissance Revival style mansion; one building; entire site See staff report to HPC, July 3, 2018 Application For Designation as a Landmark, 171 S. Grand Ave. (Shakespeare Club See staff report to Mayor & City Council, October 29, 2018 Designation of a Structure at 171 S. Grand Ave. as a Landmark

# SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION ON SIGNIFICANCE OF PROPERTY

With this application, please attach information that will assist staff with the preparation of a designation report. Books, photographs, articles, and other archival information will all be useful to document the significance of the nominated resource.

Refer to bibliography, historical photographs, chronology, and other supporting information.



# Supplemental Application for HISTORIC DESIGNATION

LEGAL DESCRIPTION

Attach a copy of the most recently recorded legal description for the property (usually in the deed for the property or other documents when the property was purchased—also available from a title company).

# **CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION**

Check the box under the category checked on first page that corresponds to the criterion under which you are nominating the property, object, sign or tree for designation. Multiple boxes may be checked if applicable.

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATING AN HISTORIC MONUMENT					
(May include significant public or semi-public interior spaces and features)					
V	A.	It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the region, state or nation.			
V	B.	It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the region, state or nation.			
N	C.	It is exceptional in the embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a historic resource property type, period, architectural style or method of construction, or that is an exceptional representation of the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose work is significant to the region, state or nation, or that possesses high artistic values that are of regional, state-wide or national significance.			
	D.	It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history of the region, state or nation.			
CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATING A LANDMARK					
	A.	It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the City, region, or State.			
	В.	It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the City, region, or State.			
	C.	It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, architectural style, period, or method of construction, or represents the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose work is of significance to the City or, to the region or possesses artistic values of significance to the City or to the region.			
	D.	It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important locally in prehistory or history.			

# THE SHAKESPEARE CLUB OF PASADENA 171 South Grand Avenue, Pasadena

#### HISTORIC MONUMENT NOMINATION

May 18, 2021

Summary: The Josephine Everett house, located at 171 S. Grand Avenue (now known as the Shakespeare Club "Villa"), was designated a Landmark by the Pasadena City Council on October 29, 2018. It qualifies for designation as a Monument under Criteria "B" and "C" because it is a distinctive example of Italian Renaissance Revival design in Pasadena designed by significant architects Sylvanus Marston & Edgar Maybury and is associated with the productive life of Josephine P. Everett, significant as a patron of the arts and philanthropist.

**Background:** Property owner, the Shakespeare Club of Pasadena, authorized Phyllis Mueller, a member of the club and historic preservationist, to submit this application for Monument status.

# Property Data

Location: 171 South Grand Avenue, Pasadena 91105 (original location)

**Date Construction Completed: 1928.** 

Cost of Construction: \$60,000

Original owner: Josephine P. Everett

**Architect:** Sylvanus Marston & Edgar Maybury

Builder: W. C. Crowell

Original use: Single family residence

**Current use:** Clubhouse for the Shakespeare Club (since 1972)

**Property area:** 40,749 square feet **Building size:** 8,580 square feet

# II. Architectural Description

The Everett house, now the Shakespeare Club, is an Italian Renaissance Revival style building located on the west side of S. Grand Ave. on a squarish lot with a frontage of 166 feet and a depth of 180 feet. A narrow "panhandle," 32.5 feet wide and 195 feet deep, extends westward from the northwest corner to connect the property to the Arroyo Seco. The property is situated directly south of the Vista del Arroyo Hotel (now the U. S. District Court of Appeals). Although the property was subdivided from that of an earlier 1892 residence, it reflects the boundaries that it had when the Everett house was built.

Originally built as a single-family residence, the property was converted for institutional use in 1972. The building is set back from the street with paved parking lots and auto circulation occupying the front, north, south and narrow west setbacks. A low stuccoed wall with a precast cap lines the street edge with short piers with large ball finials flanking the two driveway openings.

The building is U-shaped in form, composed of a two-story rectangular mass to the north with two one-story wings projecting from its south side to form a courtyard that is open to the south. The building is finished in stucco and has a shallow-pitched, hipped roof clad with clay pan tiles. The extended eaves have tightly-spaced, shaped rafter tails exposed beneath. Two stucco-clad chimneys project from the east and west wings of the two-story mass. Two other chimneys located at the south ends of the one-story wings extend significantly above the roof.

Most window openings have broad, flat surrounds that stand out from the wall plane with a sill below. Many of the windows are wood multilight casement sash, and several windows are fit with leaded glass. Including the semicircular windows of the music room. Many of the exterior pairs of doors to the library/living room, foyer, dining room, and music room were replaced with compatible glazed doors with push-bar handles for the new occupancy.

A cast stone portal derived from classical precedents contrasts with the unadorned walls, clearly marking the entrance. Heavy pilasters flank the arched doorway, with thin, abstracted ionic column capitals and an entablature bisected by a plain, exaggerated keystone. The assembly is crowned by a pediment with a coat of arms meant to recall that of the Medici of Florence. A wall lantern to the left and a small, grilled opening to the right flank the entrance. A window opening to the south, on the face of the one-story wing, is a secondary feature of the main façade with a shallow hood, a grid of iron grillwork, and brackets below the sill.

The two-story wall plane along the north façade is articulated by an arcade framing three door openings and a series of asymmetrically composed, recessed windows on the first and second stories.

The south side of the two-story portion of the building opens out to a raised patio or courtyard enclosed by the two wings, with the open end of the courtyard screened by a cast stone balustrade marked by obelisks at the corners and fountain with a female figure in the center. The floor of the courtyard is paved in stone with a border and a large "X" crossing the center in contrasting concrete in the paving (to promote drainage). Two sets of stairs lead from the outer corners of the court to ground level at the east and west, both featuring monumentally scaled volutes forming the side walls. The east staircase leads to a smaller court that is screened from the front by a high stuccoed wall which historically extended to the south property line to form a walled garden.

The two-story façade that faces into the courtyard has a second-story loggia paved in brick with cast stone columns facing south to the patio below. The varied roofline of the second story overlooking the patio adds interest and scale to the composition.

The 8,580 square foot interior is grand in scale. A square entry hall leads to an enclosed foyer that opens to the courtyard on the left (to the south) and farther along to the music room, for which Everett planned large gatherings. The architects responded accordingly, with a ballroom/music room and ancillary spaces that are sized to support it, such as the foyer, living room/library (in the front/east wing), and courtyard.

The interiors have mostly quartersawn oak floors, paneled doors, three fireplaces with (downstairs) cast stone mantels, corbels, and pilasters or (upstairs) bolection molding surrounds. Fireplaces have flat firebrick in the fireboxes laid in a distinctive herringbone pattern.

The music room is a significant interior space, both in size (at 30 by 40 feet) and in function. The space is a one and a half story volume with a deeply coved ceiling and semicircular windows set in the upper part of the side walls to the east and west. The space opens to the courtyard on the east side. A raised stage is the focus of the room, at its south end, with a wood floor. The center-rear of the stage has a centered fireplace with a cast stone surround surmounted by wood paneling. Two iron hanging light fixtures appear to be historic features but have been painted.

A broad, two-flight staircase to the second floor is located off the hall. Its barrel-vaulted ceiling forms groin vaults at the landing. A large column and capitals set into the wall further articulate the landing. In an upstairs lounge (formerly Mrs. Everett's bedroom), a large stained-glass window with Tudor arches is set in the east wall. This feature was relocated from the Shakespeare Club's prior clubhouse in the 1970s and has its own historical value in the context of the club, although it is not a historic feature of the Everett house.

#### Alterations to the Property

The property has undergone minimal exterior alterations since it was originally built in 1928. Since acquiring the property in 1972, the Shakespeare Club has worked diligently to restore and maintain historic features and materials of both the interior and the exterior, thereby protecting the building's historic integrity.

Photographic documentation shows that the library chimney had a decorative cap which is missing. Many of the exterior doors have been replaced due to the change in occupancy (partially glazed, multilight doors were replaced with heavier glazed doors with push bars), though the historic front door appears to be intact. The doors to the courtyard had wood shutters historically, as did many of the other windows throughout. In 1981, the original clay roof tiles were removed and re-installed to install weather-protective felt. The stonework and plaque to the right of the entrance are from the Shakespeare Club's former building and are not historic features of the Everett house.

Alterations to the interior are mostly confined to the service/kitchen area in the northwest corner of the main floor. The music hall is carpeted but may have wood floors beneath that are

covered, the light fixtures have been painted, and ephemeral features such as the velvet drapes over the walls were not replaced as they wore out.

### **Current Condition, Use, and Proposed Plans**

The exterior (and interior) of the building is currently in excellent condition. The current use, since 1972, is the home of the Shakespeare Club, primarily a women's club founded in 1888 for social and charitable purposes. The club has no plans to make any significant changes to the property.

# III. Historical Background and Context

## **Construction and Purpose**

Mrs. Josephine P. Everett was the wealthy widow of Henry A. Everett (1856-1917), a street railway magnate involved with the financing, construction, and operation of many early electric railways in Ohio and Detroit, Michigan. The Everetts lived in Cleveland, Ohio, and beginning in the winter of 1912, they frequently vacationed in Pasadena. After her husband's death, she made Pasadena her home, while maintaining her Cleveland connections.

Mrs. Everett was an extraordinary woman. She was a passionate patron of music, American art, and books. Her contributions were enormous, and her tireless work in furthering the cultural development of Pasadena, Los Angeles region, the Southland, and Cleveland was often recognized in her time and in the years following her death. Though she is less known today, she still deserves significant recognition now, 84 years after her death.

At a cost of \$60,000 (about \$900,000 is today's dollars) Josephine Everett built a mansion complete with a music and performance conservatory with a seating capacity of 200. Her residence provided a suitable setting to accommodate performances by the notable musicians whom she mentored and sponsored. It was also a showplace for her extensive art collection. When her estate was offered for sale in 1939, the catalog noted: "Here is regal splendor in modern dress. Beauty, exacting detail, design, workmanship and material of the finest as only such noted architects as Marston & Maybury of Pasadena, who designed and supervised the construction, would place in a dwelling of this type" (p. 20).

Everett built the property as an expression of her cultural and artistic interests, activities, and ambitions. Everything about the building—its style, its iconography, its layout, the spaces provided—was geared toward the creation of a facility that could serve as her place on the cultural stage, with the consideration of her own domestic use considered as only a small portion of the whole and not its driver.

While it's not clear whether the architects, the client, or a meeting of the minds between both created this narrative, the choice of Italian, and specifically Tuscan, villas of the Renaissance was not an accident. Above the front door itself, as one passes through the entrance, a clear message looms overhead with the inclusion of the Medici coat of arms in the cartouche: the

distinctive six floating balls became five here, but there is little doubt that it was meant to recall the great arts patrons of Renaissance Florence.

Effectively every Medici villa or palazzo has a looming cartouche bearing the family's coat of arms over the entrance. The references to Florentine or Tuscan buildings associated with the Medici are not difficult to see in the Pasadena house. The Medicis' Villa Cafaggiolo, a fortified country house of the 14<sup>th</sup> century, features plain wall surfaces with irregularly-placed and varying-sized windows with broad, flat stone surrounds that are a possible reference for the window placement and sizing on the sober façades of the Everett house. The now-missing shutters throughout would have completed the picture. The main library window with its hood and iron grate recall the main window on the façade of the Villa Cafaggiolo as well. The Medicis' Villa La Petraia could be another reference, as it encloses a vast courtyard with few openings overlooked by a second-floor loggia on one side. Its planar wall surfaces are covered in frescoes, which one could also imagine enlivening the stark walls of the Everett courtyard, though no such treatment was ever done. The varied roof planes with the distinctive pan tiles and treatment of the eaves are characteristic of Tuscan buildings; while they are not specific to any Medici building, their time and place are clearly evoked.

Behind this façade, however, the spaces located inside and their layout were determined entirely by the needs of Marston & Maybury's unusual client. Architects working in the many popular revival styles of the 1920s did not consider themselves to be reproducing the way of life, the social or economic systems, or even the functions of the buildings that they referenced; they considered themselves to be meeting contemporary needs with "modern" solutions. Though we would not consider Italian Renaissance Revival or Spanish Colonial Revival style houses "modern" by our definition today, this word was often employed in the period to describe such buildings.

The architects' plan for the house was reproduced in the auction catalog for Mrs. Everett's estate sale in 1939. The entrance hall has adjacent men's and women's "dressing rooms" (with toilet) to accommodate visitors for events held at the house. Straight ahead past the entrance hall is a long corridor which acts as the main axis off which all other significant spaces are located. Leaving the entrance hall, on the left one passes what appears to be a living room, in the east one-story wing, but which is identified on the plan as the library (given the importance of Everett's book collection). After this, on the right, appears a large dining room with arched windows at the far end. As one progresses a few steps farther down the corridor, one passes the large terrace on the left, seen (historically) through two sets of partially glazed doors, and the staircase to the second floor on the right. The music room, identified on the plan as the studio, is the culmination of this spatial progression. A 1929 newspaper article described the music room:

It is rectangular in shape, with rather low ceiling; bluish green velvet drapes cover the wall making a perfect background for the many beautiful oil paintings which are hung

there. A slightly raised platform serves as a stage for the musicians. The seating capacity is about 200.1

The acoustical improvement of the draped walls, along with the richness of texture and color that the velvet would have given the room, is an important detail in understanding the space. Imagining it hung with paintings further fills out the picture of a room that must have been an impressive sight yet also an intimate and comfortable place for musical performances.

# **Later History of the Property**

After Mrs. Everett's death, there was a four-day auction of her home and contents of her estate. Claiming the auction to be one of 1939's greatest auctions, the auctioneer's catalogue listed 40 pages of items, from *objects d'art*, a large collection of books, to home furnishings. However, the house itself did not sell.

The Everett house was occupied off and on by various residents. The house was occupied during World War II by Army medical personnel affiliated with the McCormick Army Hospital (located next door in the Vista del Arroyo Hotel). The house was also occupied by the U.S. Air Force Defense Filter Center from 1954-1958, routing reports from volunteer plane spotters to Norton Air Force Base during the nation's "Operation Skywatch," a civilian defense program.

In 1966, the Everett house was purchased for use as a home and music conservatory, but again was left vacant. Finally, in 1972, the Shakespeare Club acquired and rehabilitated the property, and the Club has been there ever since as the stewards of this extraordinary place.

In 2018, the City of Pasadena designated the Shakespeare Club "Villa," as it came to be called—the Everett house—as a Historic Landmark based on 1) its association with a significant person in the history of Pasadena, Mrs. Josephine P. Everett, and 2) its high architectural significance as designed by noted architects Marston & Maybury.

For over 49 years, the Shakespeare Club has called the Everett house its home. The Club membership has worked diligently to restore and maintain the Villa's exterior and interior grandeur and to continue its long tradition of hosting Shakespearian and other performers, guest speakers, and local artists – as well as its philanthropic participation in the Pasadena community.

IV. Significance under Criterion B: Work of Marston & Maybury Sylvanus Marston (1883-1946) was a master of an astonishing array of architectural styles ranging from the Arts & Crafts simplicity of bungalows to the opulence of Mediterranean styles such as Spanish Colonial Revival and Italian Renaissance Revival. Marston was one of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Music Room Ideal Setting for Concerts; London String Quarter will Give Historical Series of Chamber Music." Pasadena Post, 28 Sept. 1929, p. 10.

Pasadena's most distinguished and prolific architects, with his firm designing 900 to 1,000 projects throughout Southern California. Marston's legacy over a career of more than thirty years demonstrates his role as a powerful force in architectural design during Southern California's very active decades of building and changing the face of the region's built environment in the early twentieth century.

Sylvanus Marston was born in Oakland, California in 1883. His family relocated to Pasadena in the 1890s. After a public-school education in Pasadena and two years of study at Pomona College, Marston entered Cornell University in Ithaca, New York with a major in Architecture. In 1907, Marston was one of fifteen men graduating with a Bachelor of Architecture degree. That same year, he married his wife Edith, with whom he eventually had three sons. Returning to Pasadena in 1913, he formed a partnership with Garret Van Pelt which lasted ten years. In 1926, Marston entered a partnership with Edgar Maybury.

Marston was admitted to the American Institute of Architects (AIA) in 1916, and advanced to fellowship in 1942. He was president of the Southern Chapter of the AIA for two years, from 1940-42. He was also a member of the California Association of Architects, Southern Chapter.

Marston's work was not only diverse in design but widespread regionally. While most of his projects were in Pasadena and Altadena, other works extended to Los Angeles, San Marino, Alhambra, Pomona, and Claremont. Beyond that were commissions in Laguna Beach, Balboa Island, Santa Barbara (the award-winning Carrillo Hotel), Ontario (Armsley Square), Palm Springs, Mt. Baldy, Lake Arrowhead, and as far north as Los Gatos, Big Sur, and Santa Cruz.

The important role that Marston played in the development of Pasadena can be seen in the list a some of the buildings he designed with his partners:

- **Westminster Presbyterian Church** (1757 N. Lake Ave.) is considered the crown jewel of Marston's churches.
- Saint Francis Court (1909) is recognized as the first bungalow court in the U.S.; the form became a significant building type in post-WWI Southern California. Five of its original 11 units were relocated to the 600 block of S. Catalina Ave.
- The Grace Nicholson Building (1925, 46 N. Los Robles Ave.), now the USC Pacific Asia Museum, was described by architectural historian Dr. Robert Winter as "a remarkable piece of architecture... one of the finest and most colorful buildings in Pasadena" and listed on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Westridge School main building (1923, 324 Madeline Dr.)
- Home Laundry Company (1922, now Snyder Diamond, 432 S. Arroyo Parkway). A Tudor Revival style plant that echoed the appearance of the grand residences in which many of its patrons lived.
- **The Arcade Building** (1927, 696 E. Colorado Blvd.) was an innovative retail court with an intimate scale and romantic details like painted brick, arcades for shade, and a fountain.

- **Don Lee Cadillac and La Salle** (1927, now Jacob Maarse Florist, 655 E. Green St.) was among the main buildings of the newly-routed E. Green St., which was developing in the 1920s as a fashionable shopping and cultural district.
- Vista del Arroyo Hotel Bungalows (now the U.S. District Court of Appeals, 125 S. Grand Ave.) Two story, 18 room addition to the hotel, pergola, garage, interior shops. Addition of 10 bungalows; four are still standing and listed on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Cottages at the Huntington Hotel (now the Langham Hotel, (1401 S. Oak Knoll Ave.).
   Marston's firm designed seven cottages, now single-family residences; all are listed on the National Register of Historic Places.
- Hill Avenue Branch Library, Pasadena Public Library (1925, 55 S. Hill Ave.), was the first branch library developed to bring the system within reach of the neighborhoods of Pasadena. It was cited by the Southern California Chapter of the AIA as the best in its category of small buildings in 1925.
- Warner Building (1927, 469-483 E. Colorado Blvd.) was recognized with an "exceptional merit" award from the Southern California Chapter of the AIA and is distinguished by its exuberant Art Deco style green glazed terra cotta transom screen and cornice.

Among Marston's many residences, the following are particularly notable:

- **The Hardy House** (1927, 800 S. San Rafael Ave.) is a significant Spanish Colonial Revival style estate listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Its significant gardens were designed by A. E. Hanson.
- **Arthur Garfield House** (1916, 1126 Hillcrest Ave.) has Italian and Spanish features and is located on a prominent corner in the Oak Knoll neighborhood.
- **Samuel Hicks House** (1916, 880 La Loma Road) is a two-acre property with a Tudor Revival style residence set at the crest of a sweeping lawn near the Arroyo Seco.

Below are four outstanding Marston-designed projects in the Southern California region and beyond:

- Rancho Santa Fe: the Ellis Bishop Spanish Colonial Revival residential estate on 73 acres (1928). It was leased to the U.S. Navy during WWII for use as a convalescent hospital (like the Vista Del Arroyo in Pasadena.) Honored in 1933 by the San Diego Chapter of the AIA as representing "exceptional architectural merit." Listed on the National Register of Historic Places.
- <u>Claremont</u>: Padua Hills Theater (1931). Spanish Colonial Revival style. Its original use closed in 1974 but still used by Claremont Heritage for social gatherings and cultural programs. Listed on the National Register of Historic Places (1998).
- <u>City of Orange</u>: Orange County Fruit Exchange (1921). Designed in the Italian Renaissance Revival style, this small but grand and beautifully detailed building is now adaptively reused as a gallery featuring the work of California artists. Per Tuttle, the structure was said to rank "among the foremost buildings of this type not only in Orange County but in other sections of the Southland."

- <u>New Mexico</u>: Mission School, now a community center, was one of Marston's early commissions and designed in the Mission Revival style.

The significance of Marston's work in Southern California has been well established with the monograph written on him by Kathleen Tuttle, referred to above, and in the many National Register nominations for buildings that he designed throughout the region. Both the quality and the volume of his work at a high level of mastery, and in a variety of styles and building types, places him in the upper tier of architects working in Southern California in the early decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

V. Significance under Criterion B: Association with Josephine P. Everett

# Regional Significance of Josephine P. Everett

The subject property has been widely recognized as significant, having been remarked upon repeatedly in the local newspapers over the years and when the Shakespeare Club came to occupy it in 1973. The City's Primary Record survey form completed for this property states in Section B13, Significance, that the property "is significant as a fine and unusual example of Mediterranean Revival architecture in the City of Pasadena and is eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, at the local level of significance." As this was primarily an architectural survey, other criteria under which the building might be significant were not considered or evaluated at that time.

Josephine Everett took on many leadership roles with arts organizations and causes and knew how to leverage her own donations, which were often noted in the Los Angeles Times in addition to the Star News and Pasadena Post, to gain support from a broader range of donors. In addition to her financial generosity, her experience with a variety of organizations would have been an asset to the boards that she served.

The property was designated as a Landmark in 2018 for its significance as a work of Marston & Maybury, its architects, and for its association with Josephine Everett, a prominent patron of the arts who commissioned the house. Everett was a significant person in the history of Pasadena, as the prior Landmark nomination for the property established, but the impact of her work extended beyond Pasadena to a regional impact and was felt in the County of Los Angeles, in San Diego, and as far away as her native Cleveland, Ohio. Therefore, the property appears eligible as a Monument, which requires that a property have regional significance.

Josephine P. Everett commissioned the distinguished and prolific architectural firm of Sylvanus Marston & Edgar Maybury to design her residence at 171 S. Grand Avenue in 1928. She lived in the house during her most productive years of fine arts patronage and philanthropy until her death in 1937.

Josephine Everett was one of a small number of women who were significant arts patrons in Pasadena and contributed to the region's cultural climate and resources. Pasadena's institutions, with the town's early and self-conscious development as a center for art and music, led the Southern California region through much of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century.

Josephine Everett's cultural activities place her in a category with women such as Eva Scott Fenyes, an artist and collector, Grace Nicholson, a gallerist and dealer in Asian art, and Alice Coleman Batchelder, founder of the still-existing Coleman Chamber Concerts. These women had high profiles among artists, dealers, collectors, and gallerists; some had independent wealth, and all had their own interests and motivations that defined their place in the world. While women generally had limited avenues open to them professionally, Everett, Fenyes, Coleman, and Nicholson managed to make names for themselves by making the most of their privileged place in society. In addition—significantly--all (with the exception of Coleman²) used architecture to define their place in the town by constructing distinct buildings that would be their homes as well as their places of influence. The Fenyes mansion had a large wing added to the Robert Farquhar-designed house in 1911 for an art studio (and, for her entomologist husband, a smaller laboratory). Grace Nicholson's home, store, and gallery was unlike any building ever seen in Southern California (or most of the U.S., for that matter), taking the form of a Chinese temple oriented around a courtyard. Everett built a public-scaled residence with seating for concerts for 200 people and display of her art collection.

All three of these building projects—the Fenyes studio, the Everett house, and the Grace Nicholson building—had something else in common: all were projects by Sylvanus Marston, in combination with his various partners according to when they were undertaken. These three buildings have gone on to institutional uses that make excellent use of their size, robust construction (adaptable to public occupancy), and idiosyncrasies.<sup>3</sup>

#### **Contribution to the Visual Arts**

Mrs. Everett "...had been one of Pasadena's foremost citizens in the promotion of the fine arts..." (Pasadena Star News, July 5, 1937). She was an avid collector of emerging American artists of her own time, many of whom gained later significance. Her collection included works by Abbott McNeill Whistler, John Singer Sargent, Guy Rose, George Westley Bellows, Mary Cassatt, Millard Sheets, and sculptor Anna Hyatt Huntington (Arabella Huntington's daughter-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Coleman's home is considered significant today, but it was not custom-designed to meet the needs of her own arts pursuits as those of the others were; the house is historically significant mainly for its association with her husband, the tilemaker Ernest Batchelder, even though both were notable figures in Pasadena.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> While the Everett house is the home of the Shakespeare Club, the Grace Nicholson mansion went from the home of the Pasadena Art Institute through its transition to the Pasadena Art Museum, and, in 1970, became the Pacific Asia Museum, now the USC Pacific Asia Museum. The Fenyes mansion was the Finnish consulate for Los Angeles during a later generation of the family's tenure, and is open to the public as part of the Pasadena Museum of History, as it has been since its gift to the Pasadena Historical Society (forerunner of the Museum of History) in 1965.

in-law). Mrs. Everett made artworks available on display for the public to view in her Pasadena residence.

Many contemporary accounts of Mrs. Everett's collection note that her particular focus in as an art collector was the works of contemporary American artists. She professed to have a particular interest in such works since their purchase, directly from the artists, was her most effective way of supporting their careers and enabling them to continue their creative output. This seems to have distinguished her from other collectors whose ambitions led them to collect the works of known artists or recognized masters from the art centers of Europe.

Beginning in 1922, in the name of her daughter, Dorothy, who died at age 29, she donated hundreds of notable paintings and sculptures from her collection to the Cleveland Museum of Art, the Pasadena Art Institute (later the Pasadena Art Museum, forerunner of the Norton Simon Museum of Art), and the San Diego Museum of Fine Arts, as well as loaning works of art to various museums all over the country.

When 150 works from her collection were shown publicly in 1940, three years after her death, the Los Angeles Times referred to her as a "pioneer patron of American art." In 1942, five years after her death, the Pasadena Art Institute hosted a lecture on her collecting ("Mrs. Everett, a Human Collector"). The Pasadena Post noted the Pasadena Art Institute possessed "262 American paintings, drawings, engravings, and sculpture from (her) collection" which were among many works to be displayed at Grace Nicholson Galleries, which soon became the Institute's home. These works were always identified as her collection—associated with her personally as a collector and donor—after her death, and were described as "the bulk of the (Institute's) collection." Her donation had given the Pasadena Art Institute an invaluable boost as a collecting institution.

In recognition of her donations, the Cleveland Museum of Art's Bulletin stated: "The discrimination with which Mrs. Everett built up her collection over the years has given the Cleveland Museum of Art one of the basic collections of American art...a tribute to her sensibility and generous spirit" (14 June 1938).

### **Contribution as a Book Collector**

Mrs. Everett was considered a significant collector of books, having amassed 5,000 volumes, according to the estate auction house in 1939. In 1934, she donated her collection "centering around the feminist movement of the nineteenth century" to the Huntington Library, and it was noted in the 1935 Annual Review as one of two significant collections given that year (the other from the Huntington's director, Max Farrand). The Annual Review further stated that "Mrs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> "Brush Strokes: Everett Collection Shown." Los Angeles Times, 24 Nov. 1940; ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times p. C9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Grace Nicholson Gallery building was acquired by the City in July 1943, and 125 works from Everett's collection were shown in an inaugural exhibition.

Everett's gift consists of 600 volumes which fit in excellently with the Library's material relating to social movements of the nineteenth century, particularly as they affect American history." These books are said to be the foundation of the library's holdings on women's studies. She also donated "several interesting volumes dealing with nineteenth-century literature."

Today, 521 of her books are known to remain in the Huntington Library's holdings, according to staff. The augmentation of H. E. Huntington's original collection through donations by other collectors after his death helped to make the library a significant resource for scholars worldwide and built the international reputation of the institution. These donors contributed to the creation of one of Southern California's most significant scholarly institutions and ensured that it would remain a living collection.

#### Contribution as a Patron of Music

A musician herself as a pianist and singer, Mrs. Everett was a dedicated patron of musicians and a significant priority in the design of her home was providing space to host large gatherings for concerts. She hosted debut performances at her home music room of her many outstanding protégé musicians as well as a prominent chamber music group on tour. Among her protégés was Mrs. Everett's close friend, Lillian Steuber, whose fame eventually reached from coast to coast as she became one of America's leading concert pianists. Her career was in large measure due to the support and patronage that she received from Mrs. Everett.

The music room was the subject of an article in the Pasadena Post in 1929. The paper described a visit to Pasadena of an internationally acclaimed chamber music group, the London String Quartet, one of many that they made to Pasadena. The prior year they had played the Pasadena Community Playhouse (where Mrs. Everett sat on the board) under the auspices of the Coleman Chamber Concerts. The paper described, under the headline "Music Room Ideal Setting for Concerts," that following that concert:

Mrs. H. A. Everett invited a group of friends to her new home to hear the Quartet in an informal musical. After the program, it was announced that the London String Quartet had really dedicated the music room in which they played as it had never before been used. All who were present on the occasion were enthusiastic in their praise of the excellent acoustics and perfect adaptability of the room for chamber music.<sup>7</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Huntington Trustees. "Eighth Annual Report [1934]- Henry E. Huntington Library and Art Gallery" Huntington Library and Art Gallery, 1935, p. 14.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Pasadena Post, 28 Sept. 1929, p. 10.

As with the visual artists whom she supported with purchase of their artworks, she took a personal interest in the musicians she sponsored, with the goal of keeping the arts alive in the present times.

Mrs. Everett was an active member of numerous civic organizations. She was President of the Pasadena Community Playhouse (later the Pasadena Playhouse) Association and served on the Board of the Pasadena Civic Orchestra, to which she made significant financial contributions and Board of Directors of the Hollywood Bowl Theater Association. She was a member of a Shakespeare Club committee to support the City's construction of the Pasadena Civic Auditorium, which was a city-wide effort. In Cleveland, she was a member of the Cleveland Museum Advisory Council from 1923 until her death in 1937.

Finally, Mrs. Everett was a philanthropist. She is credited as the first donor to the establishment of the Hollywood Bowl Association and has always been considered one of its founders. She was a supporter of California Institute of Technology, the Pasadena Public Library, the Neighborhood Church in Pasadena, the Salvation Army, and Scripps College. Upon her death, Mrs. Everett bequeathed an estimated endowment of \$500,000 to the Cleveland Museum of Art, in addition to her donated artworks.

# Association of the Property with a Significant Person

The property is associated with Josephine Everett as her home and, more importantly, as the place of her work in the last ten years of her life as a patron of the arts in the areas of music, visual arts, and literature.

As described herein, Everett's ideals and priorities for the house as expressed in its architecture are still very much evident. The spaces and scale of the house reflect her cultural ambitions and activities, for which the house was a significant focus.

#### **Historic Integrity**

The evaluation of historic integrity is "grounded in an understanding of a property's physical features and how they relate to its significance," as the National Register guidelines state. Integrity is evaluated in terms of the seven aspects that are discussed below. For National Register eligibility, which is mirrored in Pasadena's local designation criteria, a property must have demonstrated significance and also retain its ability to convey the reasons for its significance. The most important of these for purposes of an evaluation under Criterion B is Association.

- Location: the building remains on its original site and therefore retains integrity of location.
- **Design**: The building continues to express its historic appearance through the retention of its historic form, plan, spaces, structure, and style.
- Setting: The building was constructed adjacent to the Vista Del Arroyo Hotel (now U.S. District Court of Appeals), a major landmark listed in the National Register of Historic Places. The hotel building and the surrounding residences of the same period still

characterize the neighborhood. Although the Everett house is now surrounded by its parking lot and driveways, the focus of its exterior space was always the courtyard; the size of the property is consistent with its historic boundaries.

- Materials: The building retains its original exterior materials.
- Workmanship: The building maintains integrity of workmanship. The exterior materials
  and features that reflect the craftsmanship of early 20th century single-family
  residential design and construction, including the cast stone and plaster details, the
  shaped wood rafter tails that define the eaves, remain intact.
- Feeling: The property clearly expresses the characteristics of the Italian Renaissance Revival architectural style and evokes the feeling of the early Period Revival neighborhood character-based history of Pasadena.
- Association: The property is the place where Josephine P. Everett lived for the last nine years of her life and which she had expressly designed for her activities as a promoter of the arts. It is remarkably intact from the period of her residency (1928-1937) given the change from residential to institutional use due to the Shakespeare Club's similar activities, which required little adaptation.

## VI. Conclusion

The Josephine P. Everett property at 171 South Grand Avenue satisfies Criteria B and C for designation as a Monument as defined in Pasadena Municipal Code, Chapter 17.62.040.

The building appears eligible under <u>Criterion B</u> for its association with Josephine P. Everett, who commissioned the construction of the 1928 residence and was its original owner and occupant. Josephine P. Everett was an extraordinary woman. She was a passionate collector and patron of music, American art, books, and supported many philanthropic causes. Her contributions were extensive, and she was recognized in the Los Angeles region for furthering the cultural development of Pasadena, the Southland, and her native Cleveland.

The property appears eligible under <u>Criterion C</u> as a work of the regionally significant architectural firm of Marston & Maybury. While the firm designed many substantial residences on the scale of an estate, the Everett house stands out for its expression of a particular client's cultural interests, activities, and ambitions.

Between these two criteria, the property conveys an important story about a woman's use of social, cultural, and financial capital to make a significant impact on Southern California's developing cultural climate in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. The property's designation as a Monument will bring this history into the record.

# VII. References

# Reports:

- City of Pasadena Staff Report to the Historic Preservation Commission, July 23, 2018, "Designation of a Structure at 171 S. Grand Avenue as a Landmark."
- City of Pasadena Staff Report to the City Council, October 29, 2018, "Designation of a Structure of a Structure at 171 S. Grand Avenue as a Landmark."

#### Books:

- Campbell, Candace. <u>The Everett House and How It Came to Be the Home of the Shakespeare</u>
  <u>Club</u>. Altadena: Raymond Press, 2021.
- Scheid Lund, Ann. <u>Historic Pasadena, An Illustrated History</u>. San Antonio, TX: Historical Publishing Network, 1999.
- Tuttle, Kathleen. <u>Sylvanus Marston, Pasadena's Quintessential Architect</u>. Santa Monica: Hennessey and Ingalis, 2002.
- Winter, Robert, and Davis Gebhard. <u>An Architectural Guidebook to Los Angeles</u>. Los Angeles: Angel City Press, 6<sup>th</sup> edition, 2018.

### **Booklets, Articles, and Other Publications:**

Cleveland Museum of Art, reference materials supplied by curator from archives.

- "Art Lectures Start Monday: Institute Schedules Series of Four." Pasadena Post, 12 Sept. 1942, p. 5.
- "Brush Strokes: Everett Collection Shown." Los Angeles Times, 24 Nov. 1940; ProQuest Historical Newspapers: Los Angeles Times p. C9.
- "Civic Theater Group Formed [Hollywood Bowl]; Repertory Movement will be Sponsored in City." Los Angeles Times, 4 Sept. 1930; ProQuest Historical Newspape.rs: Los Angeles Times p. A2.
- "First Showing of Rare Art Works Due." Pasadena Post, 04 Sept. 1942, p. 5.
- "Music Room Ideal Setting for Concerts; London String Quarter will Give Historical Series of Chamber Music." Pasadena Post, 28 Sept. 1929, p. 10.
- "Sylvanus Boardman Marston (Architect)." Pacific Coast Architecture Database website.
- Pasadena Star News, April 19, 1927, July 23, 1928, July 5 and 7, 1937
- Campbell, Candace. "A Brief History of the Shakespeare Club." Shakespeare Club website, 2019.

  \*\*Management of the Shakespeare Club." Shakespeare Club website, 2019.

  \*\*Accessed 13 May 2021.

- The Huntington Trustees. "Eighth Annual Report [1934]- Henry E. Huntington Library and Art Gallery" Huntington Library and Art Gallery, 1935, p. 14.
- Mueller, Phyllis, "The Woman and the Villa." Shakespeare Club website, August 2020.
- O'Connor, W. C. "A Catalog of the J. P. Everett Estate," 1939.

# **Correspondence:**

- E-mail from Livia Hirsch-Shell, Acquisitions Librarian, the Huntington Library, to John Heilbron, Professor of History Emeritus, University of California at Berkeley, April 18, 2019 (regarding current Everett gift holdings; forwarded to Phyllis Mueller, April 19, 2019).
- Telephone conversation between Phyllis Mueller and Leslie Cade, Director of Archives, Cleveland Museum of Art in April and May, 2019.

## Jennifer Trotoux 2010 Oxley Street South Pasadena, CA 91030 jennifer@trotoux.com

#### Architectural Historian and Historic Preservation Planner

May 17, 2021

Mr. Kevin Johnson Senior Planner City of Pasadena Design and Preservation Section 175 N. Garfield Ave. Pasadena, CA 91101

Dear Kevin:

I was asked by Phyllis Mueller of the Shakespeare Club to provide a peer review of the Monument nomination for their property at 171 S. Grand Avenue, known historically as the home of Josephine P. Everett.

I currently serve as the Director of Collections and Interpretation for the Gamble House Conservancy. I have been participating in historical and architectural surveys and completing local and National Register nominations for buildings and districts for twenty-five years. This translates to extensive experience with registration programs and the application of the significance criteria. I contributed to the significance statement and throughout the document, building on the extensive research that Phyllis has completed in her advocacy for the building's recognition.

I hope that the City and the Commission will concur with my conclusion and the Club's that the Everett house represents an important aspect of Pasadena's contribution to the cultural life of Southern California and maintains high historic integrity. We believe that the building is therefore eligible for designation as a City of Pasadena Historic Monument.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Trotoux

guf Juton

## Jennifer Trotoux 2010 Oxley Street South Pasadena, CA 91030 jennifer@trotoux.com

#### Architectural Historian and Historic Preservation Planner

May 17, 2021

Mr. Kevin Johnson Senior Planner City of Pasadena Design and Preservation Section 175 N. Garfield Ave. Pasadena, CA 91101

Dear Kevin:

I was asked by Phyllis Mueller of the Shakespeare Club to provide a peer review of the Monument nomination for their property at 171 S. Grand Avenue, known historically as the home of Josephine P. Everett.

I currently serve as the Director of Collections and Interpretation for the Gamble House Conservancy. I have been participating in historical and architectural surveys and completing local and National Register nominations for buildings and districts for twenty-five years. This translates to extensive experience with registration programs and the application of the significance criteria. I contributed to the significance statement and throughout the document, building on the extensive research that Phyllis has completed in her advocacy for the building's recognition.

I hope that the City and the Commission will concur with my conclusion and the Club's that the Everett house represents an important aspect of Pasadena's contribution to the cultural life of Southern California and maintains high historic integrity. We believe that the building is therefore eligible for designation as a City of Pasadena Historic Monument.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Trotoux

Inf Intonx

October 5, 2021

Shakespeare Club of Pasadena Attn: Ellen Yeany 171 S. Grand Avenue Pasadena, CA 91105

Re:

Shakespeare Club of Pasadena Historic Monument Nomination

Position - SUPPORT

Dear Ellen Yeany:

Pasadena Heritage supports the nomination to the City of Pasadena of the Shakespeare Club, the "Josephine P. Everett House," as a historic monument. It is an excellent example of the Italian Renaissance Revival style by significant architects Sylvanus Marston and Edgar Maybury. Although Spanish and Mediterranean Revival buildings abound in Pasadena and Southern California, examples in this distinctive Italian style are less common.

The details of the building, commissioned by arts patron and philanthropist Josephine P. Everett made it the perfect home for her interests. It also makes it well-suited as the home of the Shakespeare Club. Its grand entry welcomes members and guests, and its ballroom, patio, and loggia are designed to allow people to gather. The house has been used for nearly 100 years and continues as an important meeting place for Pasadena's women of culture.

The building is already landmarked. Monument designation would convey a higher level of significance and prestige, regional as well as local. Such designation would require no greater ongoing maintenance and permitting requirements by the City than landmark status.

We support Monument designation for the Shakespeare Club, and find it the fitting designation for an architectural resource of its importance.

Congratulations to the Shakespeare Club for its upcoming celebration of 50 years' proud ownership of the Villa.

Sincerely,

Susan N. Mossman Executive Director

General

Andrew Salimian Preservation Director

Anha Sili-

CC: Kevin Johnson, Senior Planner



Henry E. Huntington Library 

GIFT OF

JOSEPHINE P. EVERETT

From one of the 521 books donated to the Huntington Library by Josephine P. Everett

./9 ングイン N