ATTACHMENT C BOARD OF ZONING APPEALS DECISION LETTER Dated May 25, 2021



PLANNING & COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT PLANNING DIVISION

May 25, 2021

Kevin Franklin 30408 Olympic Street Castaic, CA 91384

Re: Conditional Use Permit #6816

1827 East Villa Street Council District #2

Dear Mr. Franklin:

Your application for a **Conditional Use Permit** at **1827 East Villa Street** was considered by the **Board of Zoning Appeals** on **May 20, 2021.**

PLN2020-00016

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT: To allow the off-site sale of a full line of alcoholic beverages (Beer, Wine, and Distilled Spirits, Type 21 ABC License) in conjunction with the operation of an existing, 3,782 square-foot grocery store (Food Sales land use).

At the conclusion of the public hearing, the Board of Zoning Appeals decided to adopt the environmental determination that the proposed project is exempt from environmental review. A motion was made to uphold the Hearing Officer's decision and **disapprove Conditional Use Permit #6816** that resulted in a 5-0 vote by the members present. As a result, action was taken to disapprove the Conditional Use Permit #6816 along with the findings in Attachment A.

You are hereby notified that, pursuant to Pasadena Municipal Code Chapter 17.72, any person affected or aggrieved by the decision of the Board of Zoning Appeals has the right to appeal this decision. In addition, a member of the City Council may stay the decision and request that it be called for review to the City Council. An appeal or a request for a call for review of this decision shall be within ten days, the last day to file an appeal or a request for a call for review is **Tuesday**, **June 1, 2021.** Appeal applications must cite a reason for objecting to a decision and should be filed with the City Clerk. Without any call for review or appeal, the effective date will be **Wednesday**, **June 2, 2021.** The regular appeal fee is \$2,790.79. The appeal fee for non-profit community-based organizations is \$1,395.39.

This project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the guidelines of the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21080(b)(5); Administrative Code, Title 14, Chapter 3, §15270(a), Projects Which are Disapproved. This Statutory Exemption states that CEQA does not apply to projects which a public agency rejects or disapproves.

For further information regarding this case please contact **Jennifer Driver** at **(626) 744-6756** or idriver@citvofpasadena.net.

Sincerely,

uis Rocka

Zoning Administrator

Enclosures: Attachment A (Specific Findings)

xc: City Manager, City Clerk, City Council, City Council District Liaison, Building Division, Public Works, Design and Historic Preservation, Department of Transportation, Hearing Officer, Code Compliance, Case File, Decision Letter File, Planning Commission (9)

ATTACHMENT A SPECIFIC FINDINGS FOR CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT #6816

Conditional Use Permit – Sale of full alcohol for off-site consumption

1. The proposed location of the site for the Conditional Use Permit will adversely affect the general welfare of the surrounding property owners.

The City of Pasadena's Police Department has reported that from January 2020 to January 2021, there have been 192 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store, with the highest number of calls to the 1800 block of Villa Street and to the intersection of Villa Street and Allen Avenue, which are in the immediate proximity to the store, for theft, public disturbances, loitering, vandalism, burglary and public drunkenness, without the sale of a full line of alcohol at this site. In addition, the Police Department provided additional data showing that there were 55 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store from January 27, 2021 to May 10, 2021. The Conditional Use Permit, for the sale of full-alcohol for off-site consumption, will exacerbate the existing issues and will adversely affect the general welfare of the surrounding property owners.

2. The proposed location of the site for the Conditional Use Permit will result in an undesirable concentration of premises for the sale of alcoholic beverages, including beer and wine, in the area.

Based on the data from the Department of Alcohol Beverage Control, only three off-site sales licenses are permitted in this census tract, and currently there are four existing off-site alcohol licenses, including the subject site's Type 20 license for off-site sale of beer and wine. While the request for a Type 21 license (off-site sale of a full line of alcohol), if approved, would not result in a discrete increase in the number of licenses, it would intensify the availability of distilled spirts. As such, approval of this Conditional Use Permit will further exacerbate this existing over-concentration. The Alcoholic Beverage Control has determined that the subject site is located in an area of undue concentration, and a finding of public convenience and necessity is required to be made by the governing body. Two other establishments with off-site alcohol sales are located within 1,000 feet of the subject site, with one liquor store, with off-site full alcohol sales, located on the adjacent parcel to the west at 490 N. Allen Avenue. As such, the finding of public convenience and necessity cannot be made.

3. The proposed location of the site for the Conditional Use Permit will detrimentally affect the nearby surrounding area after giving special consideration to the proximity and nature of the proposed use with respect to the following: a. Residential uses and residential districts; b. Hospitals, park and recreation facilities, places of public assembly, public or private schools, and religious assembly uses that attract minors and other similar uses; and c. Other establishments offering alcoholic beverages (including wine) for sale for consumption both on- and off-site.

Except for the limited commercial uses at the intersection of Allen Avenue and Villa Street, the uses within 1,000 feet are either single- or multi-family developments, north of the 210 Freeway, which is approximately 620 feet to the south. Single-family residences are located immediately to the north of the site and share access to their properties from Baldwin Alley. Directly to the east, and south, are multi-family developments. The closest school is Tiny World Pre School, which is approximately 950 feet to the east. Other schools nearby include: Jefferson Elementary, which is 0.25 miles to the southwest; Marshall Fundamental Secondary

School, which is approximately 0.33 miles to the north; and, Our School, which is approximately 0.5 miles to the north. Jefferson Recreation Center, the closest park, is approximately 0.25 miles to the southwest. The closest religious facilities are: the Calling Church, which is 0.25 miles to the southwest; Epicentre Church, which is approximately 0.33 miles to the north: and, between 0.25 and 0.35 miles to the east are several churches. including Qodesh Family Church, the Love of Christ Church, Oak Villa Gospel Hall, Crossroads Christian Fellowship, Pasadena Orthodox Presbyterian Church and Central Japanese American Community SDA Church. The City of Pasadena's Police Department has reported that from January 2020 to January 2021, there have been 192 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store, with the highest number of calls to the 1800 block of Villa Street and to the intersection of Villa Street and Allen Avenue, which are in the immediate proximity to the store, for theft, public disturbances, loitering, vandalism, burglary and public drunkenness. In addition, the Police Department provided additional data showing that there were 55 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store from January 27, 2021 to May 10, 2021, Adding the sale of full alcohol for off-site consumption will further exacerbate these issues and will detrimentally affect the nearby surrounding area that consists of residential uses, parks, schools and religious facilities..

4. The proposed location of the site for the Conditional Use Permit will aggravate proposed problems created by the sale of alcohol (e.g., littering, loitering, noise, public drunkenness, and sales to minors).

The City of Pasadena's Police Department has reported that from January 2020 to January 2021, there have been 192 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store, with the highest number of calls to the 1800 block of Villa Street and to the intersection of Villa Street and Allen Avenue, which are in the immediate proximity to the store, for theft, public disturbances, loitering, vandalism, burglary and public drunkenness, without the sale of a full line of alcohol at this site. In addition, the Police Department provided additional data showing that there were 55 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store from January 27, 2021 to May 10, 2021. The Conditional Use Permit, for the sale of full-alcohol for off-site consumption, will exacerbate the existing issues and will adversely affect the general welfare of the surrounding property owners.

5. The proposed use is not in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan.

The existing food sales land use (Linda Rosa Market) is consistent with the General Plan land use designation of Low Commercial but the request to include the sale of full alcohol for off-site consumption is not consistent with the goals and objectives of the General Plan Land Use Element (General Plan). General Plan Policy 3.7 (Alcohol and Drug Abuse) intends to manage the distribution and operation of alcohol uses through regulating and monitoring of establishments that sell alcohol in an effort to reduce the impact of alcohol problems. General Plan Policy 3.1 (High Impact Uses) seeks to avoid the concentration of uses and facilities in any neighborhood or district where their intensities, operations, and/or traffic could adversely impact the character, safety, health, and quality of life. The purpose of ABCs determination of undue concentration is to prevent the over concentration of such uses and the impact of alcohol problems. As the proposed site is located within 1,000 feet of two other established businesses that sell alcohol for off-site consumption, the project is not in compliance with the main provision of Policy 3.7 of the General Plan. Furthermore, based on the information provided by the Pasadena Police Department, from January 2020 to January 2021, there have been 192 calls for service to within 500 feet of the subject site/store for theft, public

disturbances, loitering, vandalism, burglary and public drunkenness, without the sale of a full line of alcohol at this site. In addition, the Police Department provided additional data showing that there were 55 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store from January 27, 2021 to May 10, 2021. Approval of the request to include the sale of full alcohol for off-site consumption would exacerbate the existing safety and quality of life problems in the neighborhood and would not be in compliance with Policy 3.1 of the General Plan.

- 6. Public convenience or necessity is not served in that:
 - a. The project is not a unique business addition to the community. The off-site sale of alcohol will not be a unique business addition to the community in that there is already an undue concentration of other retail sale land uses with alcohol sales for off-site consumption within the census tract, including one liquor store, with off-site full alcohol sales, located on the adjacent parcel to the west at 490 N. Allen Avenue (Type 21).
 - b. The project will not result in a positive upgrading of the area. The City of Pasadena's Police Department has reported that from January 2020 to January 2021, there have been 192 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store, with the highest number of calls to the 1800 block of Villa Street and to the intersection of Villa Street and Allen Avenue, which are in the immediate proximity to the subject store, for theft, public disturbances, loitering, vandalism, burglary and public drunkenness, without the sale of a full line of alcohol at this site. In addition, the Police Department provided additional data showing that there were 55 calls for service within 500 feet of the subject site/store from January 27, 2021 to May 10, 2021. The introduction of a full line of alcohol at this site would not help curtail these issues and would not result in a positive upgrade of the area.