

RECEIVED

PASADENA PRIVACY FOR ALL  
www.pasadenaprivacy.org

2020 SEP 18 PM 4: 57

CITY CLERK  
CITY OF PASADENA

September 18, 2020

**RE: City Council Special Meeting – September 21, 2020**  
Agenda Item #10  
Proposed Acquisition of Replacement ALPR Hardware and Equipment

Dear Members of the City Council,

Pasadena Privacy for All is a coalition of individuals and organizations dedicated to protecting the civil rights and privacy of Pasadena residents and visitors. Our organizational members include Pasadenans Organizing for Progress, the ACLU of Southern California, and Coalition for Increased Civilian Oversight of Pasadena Police. We write to oppose the proposed acquisition of additional Automated License Plate Reader devices from Vigilant Solutions, for three reasons.

First, ALPR systems constitute an unnecessary and rights-invasive technology that has not been demonstrated empirically to increase public safety. They provide Pasadena Police Department officers with an unnecessary amount of information about people's movements and driving behaviors, and are known to create an unnecessary danger of false positives.

Second, continuing to expand the City's relationship with Vigilant Solutions is a threat to immigrants within our community and to our status as a sanctuary city. It is well documented that federal immigration authorities collect Vigilant's license plate data, whether or not the police department using the systems chooses to explicitly share data with ICE. Because Vigilant contracts widely with numerous Department of Homeland Security components as well as various data aggregators and intermediaries, ICE develops has access to Vigilant license plate data. This is a grave danger to all immigrants who live or drive through Pasadena.

In response to questioning, the Pasadena Police Department correctly points out that they do not *explicitly* share Pasadena ALPR data with federal immigration authorities through Vigilant's database. Yet that only tells part of the story. Investigations conducted by the ACLU and by news outlets have reported that Immigration and Customs Enforcement accesses Vigilant ALPR data through at least three different mechanisms: formal sharing authorized by the Vigilant law enforcement client; informal sharing not specifically authorized by the law enforcement client; and through the use of third-party intermediaries that operate as data brokers. Relevant here, Thomson Reuters, which operates as a data broker for many law enforcement clients, contracts

## Martinez, Ruben

---

**From:** KristinOckershauser  
**Sent:** Monday, September 21, 2020 11:54 AM  
**To:** PublicComment-AutoResponse  
**Subject:** Comment for Item 10 on Council Agenda 9.21.20

**CAUTION:** This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor and Council Members,

Pasadena PD is requesting authorization to purchase 3 new Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR) from Vigilant Solutions. PPD takes many thousands of photos of license plates in Pasadena monthly and stores them for 2 years. Their stated purpose is to help identify stolen cars and help in criminal investigations.

Pasadena Privacy for All\* opposes this purchase from Vigilant Solutions, which provides both hardware and service agreement, and which shares PPD's ALPR data with Homeland Security. ICE has access to PPD's data via Homeland Security and massive data broker, Thompson-Reuters. (<https://www.wired.com/story/ice-license-plate-surveillance-vigilant-solutions/>) PPD denies it allows transmission of ALPR data to ICE. Apparently it does not know of the above routing, or care to investigate after being informed.

Pasadena is a Sanctuary City and prohibits trafficking with ICE.

**Pasadena Privacy for All calls on the City Council to reject the purchase of ALPRs from Vigilant Solutions today.**

Thank you,

Kris Ockerhauser

\*Pasadena Privacy for All is a coalition concerned about privacy invasion and racial bias in Pasadena's use of surveillance technology. The Coalition includes the ACLU SoCal Pasadena, POP, CICOPP, NAACP President, and NDLO.

09/21/2020  
Item 10

with Vigilant to make available ALPR data to its clients, one of whom is ICE.<sup>1</sup> The result is that ICE has access to virtually all ALPR data collected by Vigilant, irrespective of whether the client agency formally decides to share with ICE or not.<sup>2</sup> The presence of Vigilant ALPR systems in the City places immigrants within our community under threat of immigration enforcement at a time when their lives are already made uniquely vulnerable by the Trump Administration.

Third, Pasadena Police Department's policy on the use of ALPR systems provides little comfort to Pasadena residents and community members that their sensitive location data will not be stored unnecessarily or shared with others. The policy says that ALPR data will be stored for a minimum of two years, regardless of whether it is necessary for an active criminal investigation or not. Further, the policy requires regular audits and maintenance of data sharing requests from other departments who want Pasadena's data. But in response to a Public Records Act request submitted by our organization, the City confirmed that it has no records of any audits of the ALPR system or any records of data sharing requests—a violation not just of Pasadena policy, but of state law. In sum, the policy governing ALPR use by the Police Department is either too permissive, or regularly broken.

We urge Council to exercise its oversight authority to reject this acquisition, and to commit to serving Pasadena community members with solutions to their public safety needs that do not depend on rights-invasive technologies.

Sincerely yours,

Mohammad Tajsar  
Member  
Pasadena Privacy for All

---

<sup>1</sup> Press Release, "Thomson Reuters brings Vigilant license plate recognition data to CLEAR investigation platform," June 18, 2017, <https://www.thomsonreuters.com/en/press-releases/2017/june/thomson-reuters-brings-vigilant-license-plate-recognition-data-to-clear-investigation-platform.html>.

<sup>2</sup> For more information about this troubling relationship, see Talla, Vasudha, ACLU, "Documents Reveal ICE Using Driver Location Data From Local Police for Deportations," March 13, 2019, <https://www.aclu.org/blog/immigrants-rights/ice-and-border-patrol-abuses/documents-reveal-ice-using-driver-location-data>; and Newman, Lily, Wired, "Internal Docs Show How ICE Gets Surveillance Help From Local Cops," March 13, 2019, <https://www.wired.com/story/ice-license-plate-surveillance-vigilant-solutions/>.

**Martinez, Ruben**

---

**From:** yuny parada <  
**Sent:** Sunday, September 20, 2020 4:42 PM  
**To:** PublicComment-AutoResponse; yuny parada; Perez, John Eduardo  
**Subject:** Purchase of ALPR

**CAUTION:** This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Pasadena is a Sanctuary City and prohibits trafficking with ICE. I object to the purchase of ALPRs from Vigilant Solutions

**I HEREBY REQUEST THE COUNCIL TO DENY AUTHORIZATION FOR ITEM 10, THE PURCHASE OF ALPRs FROM VIGILANT SOLUTIONS THAT HELPS ICE TARGET PASADENA'S UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS.**

I oppose this purchase from Vigilant Solutions, which provides both hardware and service agreement, and which shares PPD's ALPR data with federal Homeland Security. ICE has access to PPD's data via Homeland Security and massive data broker, Thompson-Reuters. (<https://www.wired.com/story/ice-license-plate-surveillance-vigilant-solutions/>) PPD denies it allows transmission of ALPR data to ICE. Apparently it does not know of the above routing, or care to investigate after warned.

Yuny Parada

Pasadena, CA 91107

## Martinez, Ruben

---

**From:** Sonja Berndt  
**Sent:** Sunday, September 20, 2020 7:44 PM  
**To:** PublicComment-AutoResponse  
**Subject:** Agenda Item #10 -- City Council Meeting 9/21/2020

**CAUTION:** This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

Dear Mayor Tornek, Vice Mayor Hampton and Members of the City Council:  
I am a long-time resident of Pasadena. I am alarmed that the Pasadena Police Department (PPD) is gathering and storing license plate information on unsuspecting residents. A recent article noted that a local advocate had his license plate recorded 20 times in one year. Automatic license plate readers (ALPR's) pose substantial privacy risks including abusive tracking, institutional abuse, discriminatory targeting and pervasive monitoring. The PPD asserts that the information collected by ALPR's is not being used to build profiles on people and is destroyed after two years unless needed for an investigation. The overwhelming majority of people whose movements are recorded are innocent. There is no reason for the police to be keeping records of their movements for two years. Many other jurisdictions destroy all "non-hit" data quickly. Further, while the PPD says policies are in place to prevent the system from being used inappropriately, recently, a PPD representative told a news reporter that personnel look at reports to see if anything is out of place. This does not instill confidence that the serious privacy risks at issue are adequately protected. Please ensure that a rigorous audit policy is followed and that all "non-hit" data is destroyed within 48 hours of data capture. Thank you.

Sonja K. Berndt, Esq. (retired)  
Pasadena

09/21/2020  
Item 10

## Martinez, Ruben

---

**From:** David Krausse  
**Sent:** Monday, September 21, 2020 8:24 AM  
**To:** PublicComment-AutoResponse  
**Subject:** City Council item #10

CAUTION: This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

-----

Do not pass this item. Make a motion to add the automatic license plate Reading program on a future agenda to cancel the program. ALPR's are categorized as street level surveillance and heavily track and even predict future activity of millions of vehicles and their drivers. Vigilance surveillance sells their data to other law enforcement agencies and even insurance companies. This technology is Particularly disturbing as a recent traffic stop for a missing front plate resulted in the killing of the vehicles passenger, Michael McClain on 8/15/20. This technology is disproportionately Used on communities of color. If city council continues to approve this and other such technologies, they are showing that they are against the free movement of all people. According to an ACLU report, less than .02 of plate scans are linked to criminal activity or registration issues. In solidarity with Black Lives Matter Pasadena, I demand that this Orwellian technology be removed from Pasadena. Instead of further targeting communities of color, ask yourselves how you can support them and provide the resources needed To prevent vehicle violations.

Thanks,  
David Krausse

09/21/2020  
Item 10

## Martinez, Ruben

---

**From:** Yadi  
**Sent:** Monday, September 21, 2020 2:56 PM  
**To:** PublicComment-AutoResponse; Flores, Valerie  
**Subject:** Public Comment - City Council meeting 9/21/2020 Item 10.2

**CAUTION:** This email was delivered from the Internet. Do not click links or open attachments unless you know the content is safe.

No to Vigilant Solutions  
No to Automated License Plate Readers  
No to mass surveillance in Pasadena

Pasadena Resident

Yadi Y.