

Agenda Report

TO: CITY COUNCIL

DATE: JUNE 19, 2006

R0727

FROM: CITY MANAGER

SUBJECT: DESIGNATION OF 492 ELDORA ROAD AS A LANDMARK

RECOMMENDATION

It is recommended that the City Council:

- 1. Acknowledge that the designation of a historic resource is categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act under Class 8, Actions by Regulatory Agencies for Protection of the Environment (CEQA Guidelines, Article 19, §15308);
- 2. As recommended by the Historic Preservation Commission, find that the house at 492 Eldora Road is significant under Criterion B for designation as a landmark (P.M.C. §17.62.40 B) because of its association with the lives of persons historically significant in the history of the city.
- 3. Approve the designation of the property at 492 Eldora Road as a landmark.
- 4. Adopt the attached resolution approving a Declaration of Landmark Designation for 492 Eldora Road, Pasadena, California;
- 5. Authorize the Mayor to execute the attached Declaration of Landmark Designation for 492 Eldora Road, Pasadena, California; and
- 6. Direct the City Clerk to record the declaration with the Los Angeles County Recorder.

RECOMMENDATION FROM THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

On May 1, 2006, at a noticed public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission voted unanimously to recommend approval of the designation of 492 Eldora Road as a landmark.

BACKGROUND

The property owner, Jeremy Hardy, submitted the application for designation of 492 Eldora Road. Because its association with the lives of persons important to the history of Pasadena, the staff and the Historic Preservation Commission have concurred that the property should be designated as a landmark.

6.D. 7:00 P.M. MEETING OF <u>06/19/2006</u> 06/26/2006 AGENDA ITEM NO. <u>6-A--7:00-P-M-</u>

DESCRIPTION

The one-and-a-half-story house (2,315 square feet) is sited on a north-facing middle lot entered from the public sidewalk by a curving stone path. It is a wood-frame house, with two projecting steeply pitched gabled wings creating a three bay façade. Above the center bay is a shed roof dormer. The exterior walls are red tapestry brick. A brick chimney rises from the roof on the west side of the house. Southeast of the house is the garage, which has red-brick piers, a flat roof with tile coping, and a spandrel with half-timbering matching the half-timbering on the gable of the house. In the front yard, there are brick piers with cast-stone coping, and one with a wrought-iron lantern; one of the brick piers has been rebuilt and is non-contributing. Both the house and the garage and the original brick piers have retained their architectural integrity, a required finding for historic designation.

HISTORY

The house at 492 Eldora Road was built in the Tudor Revival style and designed circa 1921 by Harry L Pierce. Its first resident was Clarence P. Day. Day (1885-1969) was a well-known contractor and engineer in Pasadena throughout his professional life. After working with the Olmsted Brothers firm in the East, Day moved to Pasadena in the early 1900's. Working with the Allin Brothers' engineering firm, he helped with the design of the Annandale and Oak Knoll neighborhoods. Around 1910, he did the survey work for the new Caltech campus. His subdivisions, including the 1923 design of the Eldora Park neighborhood, were known for their winding streets which are reminiscent of his original Olmsted training. Day's firm later did work on the Grace Nicholson Building (Pacific Asia Museum) and the Westminster Presbyterian Church (both landmarks). Outside of Pasadena, Day was known for the development of the Pacific Palisades as well as being the head of civil engineering at Camp Pendleton.

Another notable resident was Henry T. Wilfong, Jr. (b.1934), who moved into the house in 1968. Wilfong was the first African American to be elected as a member of the Pasadena Board of City Directors (1973-1977). He also founded the National Association of Minority CPA firms in 1970.

ANALYSIS

The property, at 492 Eldora Road is eligible for designation under Criterion B:

[The property] is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the city. Properties eligible [under this criterion] are usually associated with a person's productive life, reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance. (How to Apply the National Register

Criteria for Evaluation, National Park Service, Park Service Bulletin #15, 2002)

The house was built for Clarence P. Day, an accomplished engineer and landscape architect who designed the Eldora Park neighborhood in Pasadena. Day is significant in the history of the city because he was responsible for the original surveying of the Caltech campus, the construction of two major public buildings, and the compilation of cartographical data of the district formerly known as North Pasadena before its annexation. As such, Day's actions while he was a resident of the house were demonstrably important within a local historic context.

Henry T. Wilfong, Jr. occupied the house beginning in 1968. Wilfong is significant in the history of the city because he was the first African American to be elected as a member of the Pasadena Board of City Directors. He served one term while he lived in the house at 492 Eldora, and left office in 1977. As such, Wilfong's actions while he was a resident of the house were demonstrably important within a local historic context.

FISCAL IMPACT

Designation of this property does not affect revenues to the City. In some instances, though, owners of designated properties may apply to the City for Historic Property Contract, which allows an alternative and often lower property tax assessment. The City Council reviewed the projected loss of property tax revenue from this program in 2002 when it adopted a local Historic Property Contract (Mills Act) ordinance.

Respectfully submitted,

ithia J. Kurt

City Manager

Approved by:

Richard J. Bruckner Director Planning & Development

Prepared by:

Jeff Cronin Principal Planner

ATTACHMENT A: Application ATTACHMENT B: Photographs ATTACHMENT C: Effects of Landmark Designation ATTACHMENT D: Map



PASADENA PERMIT CENTER

Application to Designate a Historic Resource as a HISTORIC MONUMENT OR LANDMARK

§17.52.050 of the Pasadena Municipal Code sets forth a procedure for designating any historic resource in the City as a historic monument or landmark. 1) The process begins with a preliminary evaluation by staff to determine if the nominated property meets the applicable criteria and is eligible for designation. 2) If staff determines that the nominated property is eligible for designation, the nomination is scheduled for a public hearing before the Historic Preservation Commission. 3) The Historic Preservation Commission determines if the historic resource meets the criteria for designation as a historic monument or landmark. If the Commission finds that the nominated resource qualifies for designation, it forwards a recommendation on the designation to the City Council. 4) At a noticed public hearing, the Council then determines whether to approve or deny the request for designation.

PART I. PROPERTY PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION

1. Name of Property:	"The Dayholme"	
2. Property Address:	492 Eldora Road, Pasadena, CA 91104	
3. Date of Original Construction	1920	
4. Architect / Builder:	Harry L. Pierce/J.C. Bannister	
5. Present Owner: (Name)	The Hardy Family Trust (Jeremy S. & Meggin C. Hardy as trustees)	
(Address)	492 Eldora Road	
	Pasadena	
(State/ZIP)	CA/91104	
(Phone/FAX)	(626) 622-1537	(626) 628-2160
(E-mail)) jeremy@craigestates.com	

PART II. APPLICANT

Applicant: (if not property owner)		
(Address)		
	Pasadena	
(State/ZIP)	CA/91104	
(Phone/FAX)	(626) 622-1537	(626) 628-2160
(E-mail)	jeremy@craigestates.com	
Date 2/9/06	Signature	Har
7Larzine .00087	()	Date received:

Landmark Designation Application 2005-10-31.doc Rev 8/17/2004

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT // DESIGN AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION SECTION 175 NORTH GARFIELD AVENUE T 626-744-4009 PASADENA. CA 91101 F 626-744-4785



L

Application to Designate a Historic Resource as a HISTORIC MONUMENT OR LANDMARK

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATION

CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATING A HISTORIC MONUMENT

 It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the region, state or nation.
 It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the region, state or nation.
3. It is exceptional in the embodiment of the distinctive characteristics of a historic resource property type, period, architectural style or method of construction, or that is an exceptional representation of the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder whose work is significant to the region, state or nation, or that possesses high artistic values that are of regional, state-wide or national significance.
 It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history of the region, state or nation.

A historic monument designation may include significant public or semi-public interior spaces and features.

 CRITERIA FOR DESIGNATING A HISTORIC LANDMARK		
 It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city. 		
 It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the city. 		
3. It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a locally significant historic resource property type, architectural style, period, or method of		

	construction, or that represents the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or builder who is locally significant, or that possesses high artistic values that are locally significant.
—	4. It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important locally in
	prehistory or history.

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT // DESIGN AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION SECTION



Application to Designate a Historic Resource as a HISTORIC MONUMENT OR LANDMARK

PART III: TYPE OF DESIGNATION

PROPERTY TO BE DESIGNATED AS A:

A historic monument means any historic resource that is significant at a regional, state or national level, and is an exemplary representation of a particular type of historic resource.	A landmark means any historic resource that is significant at a local level, and is an exemplary representation of a particular type of historic resource.

PART IV: BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY

Briefly describe the property proposed for designation, indicating whether the entire site or a portion of the site is the subject of the nomination (e.g., how many buildings on the site). A map may be used for the description. Please also submit recent photographs. Use continuation sheet if necessary.

Refer to continuation sheet, site plan and recent photographs.

Please see attached.

PART V: SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION ON SIGNIFICANCE OF PROPERTY. With this application, please attach information that will assist staff with the preparation of a designation report. Books, photographs, articles, and other archival information will all be useful to document the significance of the historic resource.

Refer to bibliography, historical photographs, chronology, and other supporting information.

PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT // DESIGN AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION SECTION



THE BUILDING BIOGRAPHER TIM GREGORY

- Building Histories
- Cultural Resource Studies
- Historic Resources Surveys
- Local, State, and National Landmarking
- * Historic Preservation and Archival Consulting

492 ELDORA ROAD PASADENA

"Dayholme"

Style: English Revival

Year Completed: 1920

Architect: Harry L. Pierce, Los Angeles, who was known more for his church architecture. This was one of his few documented residences. Please see the attached biographical information about Mr. Pierce.

Builder: J. C. Bannister, Los Angeles.

First Owner: Clarence Parkman Day, a well-known Pasadena-based contractor and engineer who developed several neighborhoods in the Los Angeles area, including Eldora Park. Mr. Day had this house built as his own home, sharing it with his wife Sallie F. Day and their children. Additional material on Mr. Day is attached.

Original Building Permit: #2210 B, issued by the City of Pasadena on June 29, 1920 for a onestory, six-room residence. The house, to measure approximately 35.5 by 45.5 feet with a maximum height of 24 feet, would have a concrete foundation, wood-frame and plaster walls, a shingled roof, one brick chimney, and wood floors.

A copy of this permit is attached.

Cost to Build: \$8,000-a higher-than-average cost for a new house of this size in 1920.

Other Building Permits: A new gas vent and gas outlet were installed in December 1931. The furnace was replaced in the early 1930s. An Electrolux vacuum cleaning system was installed in September 1936.

Tel: (626) 792-7465 & Fax: (626) 793-5219 E-mail: timgregory@sbcglobal.net 400 East California Boulevard, #3 & Pasadena, California 91106-3763 In June 1942, a permit was issued to add a sleeping porch to the second floor. J. Milton Hovey was the contractor for this job, valued at \$365. A copy of this permit is attached. The bedrooms and hall were re-wired at the same time.

The house was re-roofed with wood shingles in February 1947 for \$400. It was partially re-roofed again in May 1956.

A new extension to the public sewer was made in February 1948. That same month, new plumbing fixtures for one bathroom were installed.

The roofs of both the house and garage were repaired in February 1964 for \$356. New ridges were installed in the house roof.

In April 1974, a new kitchen sink was installed and electrical work done. The electrical service to the house was also to be replaced at that time.

The water heater was replaced in December 1995. The kitchen was rewired and a sub-panel added in the garage in November 1996. Electrical service to the house was upgraded to 200 amps in October 2005.

Assessor's Records: The Pasadena City Assessor first visited the property on December 6, 1921 and recorded a newly completed single "bungalow" with a concrete foundation, plaster walls with brick veneer, a flat and hipped gabled and cut-up roof covered in shingles, three dormers, and wood and brick ornamental trim. Heat was provided by a fireplace and a gas furnace. There were ten plumbing fixtures. Interior finishes were described as both "plain" and "special." A buffet was built-in. Over-all construction quality of the house was "good"–the highest category on the Assessor's form.

The Assessor estimated the square footage at 2,315. On the first floor were two living rooms (one was probably a dining room), three bedrooms, one bathroom with a tile floor, and a kitchen. The second floor contained another three bedrooms. The house had a total of seven hardwood floors. There was also a basement that measured 16 by 12 feet. The garage, measuring approximately 20 by 22 feet, had a concrete floor, plaster exterior, and a composition roof.

The Assessor returned on December 3, 1942 to record the completion of the sleeping porch. Of irregular shape, it measured approximately 9 by 10 feet.

The Los Angeles County Assessor currently estimates the square footage of the house at 2,571. Copies of the City Assessor's records are attached.

(Note: The Pasadena City Assessor's Office ceased operations in 1974. Their square footage totals often differed from those of the Los Angeles County Assessor's Office, since they

frequently included garages, terraces, patios, etc. in their computation. It is advisable to rely on the County Assessor's square footage figures since they are more up-to-date and consistent.)

Other Owners and Residents: In 1931, title to the property was recorded in the name of First Securities Company. (Mr. Day and his family had moved to Cumberland Road in San Marino.) Andrew W. Stewart, president of his own investment securities firm, became the owner in 1935. He shared the house with his wife Eleanor Cook (Clark) Stewart. Andrew W. Stewart & Company was located at 234 East Colorado, Room 102. Mr. Stewart (1892-1946), a native of Pennsylvania and a resident of Southern California since 1907, attended Occidental College but graduated from Princeton, with a master's degree in economics in 1918. After pursuing a career in the bond business, he developed an interest in citrus ranching, owning large groves in Orange and Ventura Counties. Mr. Stewart was very active in the community, having served as vice-president of the local YMCA and treasurer of the Pasadena Chapter of the American Red Cross. A biographical article about Mr. Stewart is attached. Mrs. Stewart attended Wellsley College. After being widowed, she remained in the Eldora Road house for several years.

By 1949, Mrs. Stewart had sold her home to William E. and Stella E. Kerzman. Mr. Kerzman was in the real estate business at 1173 East Colorado. By the early 1950s, he was working as an appraiser for Mutual Savings & Loan of Pasadena.

Around 1955, title to the property passed to Roland Mitchell, who was president of Elnet of California, Inc. Mr. Mitchell resided elsewhere in Pasadena. The resident of 492 Eldora at that time was Claude H. Mitchell who worked as an inspector for the County Building Department. At some point, Mr. and Mrs. Kerzman re-possessed the property.

The next owner, in April 1968, was Henry T. Wilfong, Sr. and his wife Geraldine. Mr. Wilfong was employed as a plasterer. Mr. and Mrs. Wilfong lived elsewhere. Their son Henry T. Wilfong, Jr., occupied the Eldora house. The younger Mr. Wilfong, born in 1934 and raised in Pasadena, was self-employed as a certified public accountant, with offices in Los Angeles. He is probably best remembered for being elected the first African-American member of the Board of City Directors (now known as the City Council) in 1973. He served one term, leaving office in 1977. Mr. Wilfong was also active in the NAACP, the Chamber of Commerce, and Pasadenans for Progress. He founded the National Association of Minority CPA Firms in 1970. He later moved to Los Angeles. Several articles about Mr. Wilfong are attached.

Grant H. and Pearline E. McGruder purchased the property in October 1976. The Bankers Trust Company became the owner in August 1994, followed by Quality Mortgage USA, Inc. in October 1994. Walter D. Lauderdale, et. al., were the recorded owners in November 1995.

Jeremy S. and Meggin Hardy purchased the property in October 2003. Mr. Hardy became sole owner in December 2004.

Notes: This house was the first built in Eldora Park and undoubtedly served as a model home. Mr. Pierce evidently designed several other houses in the development for Mr. Day. Several of the early residents were either employees of Day's firm or were in the construction business.

The house was featured in the October 1921 issue of *Keith's Magazine*, a periodical dealing with modern home-building. It was described as "not only attractive within and without, but every room is full of light and air, the closet space is unusually generous, and but little furniture is necessary to make it home-like." The flexibility of the floor-plan was especially emphasized. Mr. Day was quoted as saying, "I know of no small space–and few large ones–more satisfactory." A copy of the article is attached.

Clarence Day laid out the Eldora Park subdivision to accommodate decorative street lights, underground utilities, and winding gravel sidewalks that meandered around parkway trees-mostly incense cedars which were the designated street trees. One of the lots in the tract was intended to be developed into a tennis court for the use of neighborhood residents. The *Pasadena Star-News* published a promotional article and advertisement for Eldora Park on January 27, 1923, calling it a "beautiful piece of ground" and "a residential park of refinement." Copies are attached.

A copy of the City's official historic resources inventory page on 492 Eldora is attached. It is described as "one of the best designed houses on the street."

The Pasadena Museum of History has a number of photographs of the house in its Clarence Day collection. A few are reproduced in this report, including a Christmas card sent by Mr. and Mrs. Day in 1929.

Significance: The Day house is potentially eligible for listing on a local inventory of significant buildings due to its association with a prominent first owner, its status as a "model home" for the Eldora Park development, and its contribution to the architectural and historical context of its neighborhood.

.....

.....

Sources:

Los Angeles Public Library City of Pasadena, Planning and Development Department (Design & Historic Preservation Section) Pasadena Public Library Pasadena Museum of History (Research Library and Archives)

Gebhard, David and Robert Winter. An Architectural Guidebook to Los Angeles. Salt Lake City, Gibbs-Smith, 2003.
McAlester, Virginia and Lee. A Field Guide to American Houses. New York, Knopf, 1984.
Pasadena Community Book, 1947.

City Directories: 1921-

Keith's Magazine: October 1921 Los Angeles Times: January 7 and 18, 1969 Pasadena Star-News: January 27, 1923; January 6, 1973; July 20, 1981; March 27, 1984

Tim Gregory The Building Biographer 400 East California Blvd., #3 Pasadena, CA 91106-3763 Phone: 626-792-7465; Fax: 626-793-5219 e-mail: timgregory@sbcglobal.net

Copyright November 2005

ATTACHMENT B



ATTACHMENT C: EFFECTS OF LANDMARK DESIGNATION

Identifying and designating properties of major significance encourages the preservation and protection of Pasadena's historic resources. The City of Pasadena's Historic Preservation Ordinance provides a process to recognize and protect individual sites and historic districts.

Designation Process

A property may be nominated for historic designation by any person. Design & Historic Preservation staff then evaluates the property to determine if it meets the criteria for designation. If it appears that the criteria have been met, the staff will prepare a designation report, which describes the property and how it meets the criteria for designation. Once the designation report is complete, the HPC will conduct a public hearing and make a recommendation to the City Council. The City Council may then designate the property as a historic site.

Alterations/Demolition

Designated historic structures are protected by the Municipal Code. A Certificate of Appropriateness (permit) is required for work to modify the exterior appearance of a designated historic property that is open to public view. A certificate is also required for alterations, additions, new construction, or demolition. This review ensures that any proposed changes are compatible with the character of the individual property and/or historic district. Decisions on proposed alterations are based on the proposed project's compliance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and the City's adopted *Design Guidelines for Historic Districts*, which is based on the Standards.

The Historic Preservation Commission is the decision-maker for major projects affecting designated historic resources, except in the Central District where the Design Commission is the decision-maker for such projects. Staff is the decision-maker for minor projects affecting designated historic resources. Major projects are defined as demolition, relocation, removal of significant features, significant alteration of front or side elevations, additions to street-facing elevations, and new fences or walls in landmark districts. Minor projects are defined as removal of insignificant exterior features, re-roofing, matching replacement doors and windows, demolition of garages, small side/front additions, most rear additions that are not taller than the original building or replacement of exterior cladding with the same cladding material. Projects affecting non-contributing buildings on a site or in a district, or the environmental setting of a site, are reviewed by staff but are subject to the less stringent requirements than contributing buildings.

Staff-level decisions may be appealed to the Historic Preservation Commission, and decisions by the Commission may be appealed to the City Council. The City Council may also "call for review" all decisions by the staff or Commission.

Incentives

Designated historic properties are eligible for the following incentives, which are evaluated on a case-by-case basis:

- A Mills Act historic property contract to reduce property taxes in exchange for agreeing to maintain the historic character of the property in accordance with established guidelines.
- Use of more flexible provisions in the State Historical Building Code when making modifications,
- Waiver of covered parking requirements, and
- Potential variances from modern development standards for historic properties undergoing adaptive use or relocation.



RESOLUTION NO.

A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF PASADENA ADOPTING A DECLARATION OF LANDMARK DESIGNATION FOR 492 ELDORA ROAD, PASADENA, CALIFORNIA

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission has found that 492 Eldora Road meets criterion b, as set forth in Section 17.62.040(B) of the Pasadena Municipal Code; and

WHEREAS, the house at 492 Eldora Road qualifies for a historic designation because of its associations with the lives of persons who were significant in the history of the City (Clarence P. Day; Henry T. Wilfong);

WHEREAS, the application for Landmark designation is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to State CEQA Guidelines Section 15331;

WHEREAS, the owner of the property, Jeremy Hardy, nominated the property for Landmark designation; and

WHEREAS, the City Council may approve a recommendation from the Historic Preservation Commission to designate a Landmark and evidence such approval by adopting a declaration executed by the Mayor pursuant to Subsection 17.62.050 (C) of the Pasadena Municipal Code;

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED by the City Council of the City of Pasadena that the attached declaration of Landmark designation for 492 Eldora Road is hereby adopted.

Adopted at the _____ meeting of the City Council on the _____ day of ____, 2006 by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

Jane Rodriguez, City Clerk

Approved as to form:

Michele Beal Bagneris, City 7Attornev

DECLARATION OF LANDMARK DESIGNATION FOR:

492 Eldora Road PASADENA, CALIFORNIA

Pursuant to the provisions of Section 17.62.070 of the Pasadena Municipal Code, the City Council of the City of Pasadena by this declaration hereby designates as a Landmark certain real property described as:

(See attached Exhibits "A" & "B")

Under Pasadena Municipal Code Section 17.62.090, all work affecting designated Landmarks, except ordinary maintenance and repair, such as but not limited to new construction and additions, exterior alterations, relocation, and demolition, is subject to review by the City of Pasadena Historic Preservation Commission.

DATED:

ATTEST:

CITY OF PASADENA A municipal corporation

Jane Rodriguez, City Clerk

By: _____ Bill Bogaard, Mayor

EXHIBIT "A" 492 ELDORA ROAD

Lot 5 and the East 10 feet of Lot 4 of Eldora Park in the City of Pasadena, County of Los Angeles, State of California as per map recorded in Book 43, Page 1 of Maps, in the Office of the County Recorder of said County, described as follows:

Beginning at the Northeast corner of said Lot 5 said point being also on the South line of Eldora Road (60.00 feet wide) as shown on said map;

Thence along the East line of said Lot 5, South 00°09'00" West, 134.00 feet to the Southeast corner of said Lot 5;

Thence along the South line of said Lots 4 and 5, North 89°51'45" West, 70.00 feet to a line parallel with and 10.00 feet West of the West line of said Lot 5;

Thence along said parallel line, North 00°09'00" East, 134.00 feet to the North line of said Lot 4, said point being also on the said South line of Eldora Road;

Thence along said South line, South 89°51'45" East, 70.00 feet to the Point of Beginning.

All as shown on Exhibit "B" attached herewith and made a part hereof.

The above described parcel contains approximately 9,380 square feet (0.215 acres), more or less.

This real property description has been prepared by me, or under my direction, in conformance with the Professional Land Surveyors Act.

Barry C. Henry, R.L.S. 6793

Expires: 09/30/06

Date:





P;\P\PDAX0067\#BS086/V7_492Ekdor.cRdp2.dgn

. . . .