

ATTACHMENT A

HISTORIC/ARCHITECTURAL EVALUATION

Criterion: *It is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of the history of the city.*

Even though the house is associated with the early development of Pasadena, it is not one that qualifies under this criterion. In the context of the City's early development, it is a modest example from the period. There are numerous other vernacular houses from the period that are better examples of vernacular housing types from the late nineteenth century. In addition, the roof system and upper one-half story were completely rebuilt after major fire damage in the 1960s, which diminishes the architectural integrity of the house. The house is more appropriately evaluated in the context of development of the neighborhood as a contributor to the Garfield Heights Landmark District, if the district were to be expanded, and not as an individually significant property, which requires a more rigid adherence to architectural integrity under this criterion.

Criterion: *It is associated with the lives of persons who are significant in the history of the city.*

According to National Register guidelines for evaluating properties for association with lives of significant persons, the house does not qualify for designation because of its former owners or residents. The guidelines state: "A property is not eligible if its only justification for significance is that it was owned or used by a person who is a member of an identifiable profession, class, or social or ethnic group." From 1888 to 1901, the house was owned by Henry C. Lewis who purchased it along with 341 Adena² from R. K. Janes. Documentation of the purchase price of the two properties indicates that Janes was responsible for construction of both buildings. The facts that Henry C. Lewis was not responsible for construction of the house, that he owned it for thirteen years, and he was, in the contexts of the City's development history, only one of many early land speculators in Southern California do not validate conclusively that the house is significant under this criterion. National Register guidelines also state, "Properties eligible under (this criterion) are usually those associated with a person's productive life, **reflecting the time period when he or she achieved significance** [emphasis added]." Ownership alone of the property by early settlers and speculators, R. K. Janes, and Henry M. Lewis does not justify designation of the property. There is no documented evidence that these early owners are distinguished among other early settlers for their contributions to the history of Pasadena.

² Designated as a landmark by the City Council on January 23, 2006. The property was designated because it met criteria "c" because it is an excellent example of Queen Anne residential design.

At the Historic Preservation Commission public hearing, the applicant asserted that the house at 361 Adena is significant for its association with Anna Luckey (1860-1949), a social worker and author. The same guidelines stated above, however, would apply to an occupant as well as an owner of the property. Mrs. Luckey's association with the house is speculative. Staff has extensively researched tax assessor records, period city directories and Sanborn maps³ and has been unable to verify conclusively that she resided in this house⁴⁵ and that if she did that any of her many achievements occurred during her residency on Adena Street.⁶ Because it is inconclusive that Anna Luckey ever lived at 361 Adena Street or that she made a significant contribution to the City's history when she lived on Adena Street, staff cannot verify that the house meets this criterion for an association with Mrs. Luckey.

Criterion: It embodies the distinctive characteristics of a locally significant historic resource property type, architectural style, period, or method of construction, or that represents the work of an architect, designer, engineer, or building who is locally significant, or that possesses high artistic values that are locally significant.

The late nineteenth-century house on the property does not embody the distinctive characteristics of the vernacular Queen Anne or Colonial Revival architectural styles that were prevalent in the late nineteenth century; rather, it is a modest house with only minor references to architectural design details of the period. In addition, according to tax assessor records, the roof of the house was completely rebuilt after a fire in 1966 (Exhibit 1). Its current appearance and period photos that show the house in the background of one taken of 341 Adena indicate that the roof pitch and dormers have been altered, an alteration that

³ Houses that are shown on the earliest Sanborn map of the area are 341, 361, 371, 385, 395 and 405 Adena. The houses at 341, 361 and 385 are recorded as pre-1900. Tax Assessor records document the construction dates of 371 (1917), 395 (1910) and 405 (1900). It is unclear whether 405 was occupied when the 1900 City Directory was prepared; if not, then 341, 361 and 385 were the only three house on the street by the time of that directory listing.

⁴Tax Assessor records and Sanborn Maps verify that by 1900, there were only three houses on Adena between Garfield and Los Robles. The 1900 City Directory lists three houses with occupants on Adena. Although, in the same directory, Mrs. J.B. Hurlbut (owner of record) is listed at the first house on Garfield north of Mountain, it cannot be ascertained definitively that Mrs. Luckey was not also residing at 341 Adena in 1900. The first house east of Garfield and the first house north of Mountain on Garfield could be the same house. The use of early City Directories alone to verify occupancy of a particular person, especially in cases where there are not numbered addresses is unreliable in some cases.

⁵There is no evidence that Luckey lived on Adena for more than even one year. A November 1899 newspaper article documents her residency on Adena, and the 1900 census places her on Parke Street. In fact, she appears to have moved many times in a twenty-five-year period. The 1899 Pasadena Evening Star "Society Gossip" column that documents a charity benefit at her house on Adena describes a sun room that was decorated as a Japanese Tea House. The high-style house at 341 Adena is a large 2-story structure with a sun room on the east front elevation. The probability that the house at 361 Adena had a sunroom is unlikely; assessor records show a seven room house and reveal no evidence of a sunroom

⁶ Known residences of Mrs. Luckey are 438 Elm (1893), Adena Street (1899-1900), Parke Street (1900), 39 S. Euclid (1907-08), 1 Cabrillo Place (1914-15), 1182 N. Michigan (1915-16). In later years she also lived at 2865 N. Lake, 83 ½ N. Catalina, 597 N. Mentor, 455 N. Raymond and 408 E. Del Mar.

compromises the architectural integrity of the house. In the historic context of residential architecture of the late 1800s, the house does not warrant the level of distinction that individual landmark designation would bring. There are many more important examples of late nineteenth-century styles exhibited in both large and small dwellings that remain in the City. In addition, the house lacks architectural integrity under this criterion because it has been substantially altered from its historic turn-of-the-century appearance.

Criterion: *It has yielded, or may be likely to yield, information important locally in prehistory or history.*

Because there are more outstanding examples of the vernacular Queen Anne/Colonial Revival house from the late 1880s and early 1890s in the City, 361 Adena Street does not exhibit unique or important architectural features that would yield important information in the study of the period or type of architecture.

In its determination of whether 361 Adena Street meets the criteria for individual designation, staff followed the National Register guidelines for comparing the property to other properties of the same period of significance. In this analysis, staff identified better-representative examples of turn-of-the-century period vernacular houses that have a high degree of architectural integrity. Exceptional and intact examples that meet the criteria for individual designation as a landmark are 1360 Lida St., 714 N. Mentor Ave., 1277 and 1298 N. Garfield Ave.

ATTACHMENT B

