

FINDINGS FOR ALL SAINTS CHURCH MASTER PLAN (ALTERNATIVE 7)

The revised Master Development Plan incorporates conditional use permits and variances:

Conditional Use Permits

- Conditional Use Permit for a restaurant with walk-up window
- Minor conditional use permit for shared parking
- Minor conditional use permit for commercial off-street parking
- Minor conditional use permit for tandem parking spaces

Variances

- Variance to provide more than the maximum allowed setback along Euclid Avenue
- Variance to provide more than the maximum allowed setback along Walnut Street
- Variance to allow a portion of a fence along Walnut Street to exceed the four foot height limit
- Minor variance for the construction of a columbarium within twenty feet of a property line
- Variance to have two loading spaces on the street

I. Findings for Approval of the Master Plan

1. The proposed uses are allowed with a Conditional Use Permit (Major or Minor) or Hillside Development Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code in that All Saints Church is a religious facility (with accessory uses such as retail sales, café, and offices) with a columbarium and is a permitted use within the CD-2 - Civic Center Midtown Sub-District of the Central District Specific Plan (CDSP). The child day-care center is also a permitted use within the CD-2 subdistrict. The Planning Director has the authority to require a Master Plan for any public, semi-public use. All Saints Church and the child day-care center are classified under the Zoning Code as public, semi-public uses and have been required to submit an application for a Master Plan. A Master Plan acts as a comprehensive conditional use permit, and the uses approved by the Master Plan are governed by its terms and conditions of approval. A Master Plan is subject to five year review hearings before the Planning Commission.

With the variances approved as part of this application, the proposed expansion of All Saints will meet all of the requirements of the Zoning Code. This includes the development standards of the CD-2 district for parking, floor area ratio, setbacks and height requirements. The day-care center will meet all of the requirements of Section 17.50.080 including outdoor play space, screening, parking, loading, lighting, refuse storage, outdoor lighting and hours of operation.

2. The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district. All Saints Church is located at the southeast corner of Walnut Street and Euclid Avenue in the Civic Center Core Precinct of the CD-2. The proposed project¹ is consistent with the following purposes of the Zoning Code: 1) Provide standards for the orderly development of the City and continue a stable pattern of land uses and 2) Conserve and protect the historical integrity and character of the City's neighborhoods. All Saints Church Master Plan is consistent with

¹ In these Findings, the "proposed project" refers to Alternative 7 in the Final EIR, as modified by the mitigation measures applicable to Alternative 7 (described in FEIR General Response #3), and modified by the Conditions of Approval.

these purposes in that it is meeting the standards for development in the Civic Center precinct. These standards include: height, floor area ratio, and parking. The Master Plan ensures the protection of the existing historic church complex including the sanctuary, Regas House, and the rectory as well as the Maryland Hotel Wall.

The purpose of CD-2 is to strengthen its role as the symbolic and governmental center of the City, supporting civic, cultural, and public service institutions, while augmenting the character of the precinct with a complimentary mixture of uses. Religious facilities and child day-care centers are uses permitted by right and the proposed ancillary uses are consistent with the purposes of the Zoning Code and CDSP. The All Saints Church expansion project achieves the following CDSP goals:

The precinct character is defined as the City's symbolic center and calls for building design to be the highest quality and respectful of the landmark civic buildings in the area. The building complex is oriented around a central courtyard that carries forward the community character of Pasadena. The Public Realm Design Guidelines of the Central District Specific Plan encourages the use of plazas as important civic and urban places and call for development to focus activity and attention upon and along these spaces. Additionally, these guidelines encourage the use of plazas, walkways and pedestrian paseos to increase physical connectivity. These are a predominate element of the Civic Center area with it various walkways, courtyards and plazas. The site design places smaller scale buildings (one to three-stories) near the original church cloister and taller buildings at the east edge of the project site, thereby respecting and protecting the historic nature of the existing structures. The West Building matches the height of the existing Rectory and the Forum building is lower in height than the original sanctuary. The three new buildings closest to the original church are well below the allowable 75-foot height limit for the area. The proposed North Building - Building E on the north end would be 45 feet tall. The building placement is respectful of the original church cloister by setting aside a significant amount of space to serve as a transition between the existing historic buildings and the new structures. The Maryland wall is preserved and a substantial courtyard has been created by shifting the west building further to the north. An additional courtyard is proposed to be established north of the West Building to house the café. This follows the traditional pattern of development along Euclid Avenue.

The CDSP encourages new buildings to accommodate pedestrian movement along Euclid Avenue to reinforce the link between the Civic Center core and the commercial activity along Colorado Boulevard to the south. The West Building and outdoor café face Euclid Avenue and are placed behind a landscaped setback that is similar to the placement of the original church cloister from the street. The West Building placement has been moved north under Alternative 7, expanding the courtyard behind the Maryland Hotel Wall. The availability of off-street parking will benefit the institutional uses in Civic Center in general, and other nearby uses, like the nearby restaurants specifically, by allowing pedestrians to park once and walk to multiple destinations.

3. The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan (Central District Specific Plan) in that the project is consistent with the following objectives and policies:
 - a. Guiding Principle 1 - Growth will be targeted to serve community needs and enhance the quality of life. The proposed project is located within the Central District Specific Plan area, which is identified by the General Plan as one of several areas within the

City targeted to accommodate future growth. All Saints needs this additional space in order to meet its religious mission and to service the community.

- b. Guiding Principle 2 - Change will be harmonized to preserve Pasadena's historic character and environment. The site layout and building shapes are sensitive to the design elements of both the existing Church and surroundings. The layout of the buildings is organized around a central courtyard much like the original church cloister although in a north-south orientation rather than an east-west orientation. The new building orientation is around a central courtyard that carries forward the traditions and character of Pasadena development. The proposed building mass and bulk reflect the existing scale of surrounding structures and create a horizontal and vertical visual rhythm along the streetscape. The building massing both correlates to the existing religious assembly buildings and the surrounding buildings along Walnut Street. The Master Plan for the proposed expansion preserves the existing cultural resources (All Saints Church original sanctuary, landscaped courtyard, and Maryland Hotel Wall).
- c. Guiding Principle 4 - Pasadena will be promoted as a Healthy Family Community. The proposed building complex will provide community serving uses including a day-care center and after school recreation programs.
- d. Guiding Principle 5 - Pasadena Will Be A City Where People Can Circulate Without Cars. The ancillary off-street parking use during weekdays will benefit surrounding property and business owners. Use of alternate modes of transportation is encouraged as All Saints Church is located within a 1/2 mile of two Goldline Metro light rail stations, Memorial Park and Lake Avenue, and within short walking distances to various bus lines. Furthermore, the church is required to implement a Transportation Demand Management program that encourages alternative modes of transportation.
- e. Guiding Principle 6 - Pasadena Will Be Promoted as a Cultural, Scientific, Corporate, Entertainment and Educational Center for the Region. The proposed project supports the objective of creating an exciting urban core by expanding the existing cultural institution that serves residents in the surrounding area. The All Saints Church Master Plan will accommodate the current and future program needs of a significant Pasadena institution.
- f. Guiding Principle 2 - Objective 5 - Character and Scale of Pasadena: Preservation of Pasadena's character and scale, including its traditional urban design form and historic character, shall be given highest priority in the consideration of future development. Policy 5.5 - Architectural and Design Excellence. The City shall actively promote architectural and design excellence in buildings, open space and urban design and shall discourage poor quality development. The site layout and building shape are sensitive to the design elements of both the existing Church and City Hall. The layout of the buildings is organized around a central courtyard much like the original church cloister although in a north-south orientation rather than an east-west orientation. Maximizing the use of outdoor areas reduces the quantity of enclosed space necessary and ensures access to light and air to the adjacent restaurant building on the north side of the project site. By reducing building mass and bulk, the new buildings reflect the scale of the surrounding existing structures. Thus the building massing both correlates to the existing church buildings and the entire block as a

whole. The Master Plan for the proposed expansion preserves the existing cultural resources (All Saints Church original buildings and Maryland Hotel Wall).

- g. Guiding Principle 4 - Objective 18 - Improved Environment: Improve the quality of the environment for Pasadena and the region. Policy 18.6 - Construction Materials Recycling: Promote recycling of construction materials to reduce use of natural resources and minimize impacts in waste management. The proposed buildings will be constructed in accordance with the City's Green Building Practices Ordinance. The courtyards include the use of native plants and water conserving materials appropriate for the regional climate. The proposed All Saints Church expansion is subject to design review which will ensure use of the highest quality building materials.
- h. Guiding Principle 5 - Objective 21 - Circulation: Make Pasadena a city where there are effective and convenient alternatives to using cars. Policy 21.5 - Parking Management: Manage parking to reduce the amount of land devoted to frequently vacant parking lots. The proposed development will remove an unattractive parking lot and replace it with one level of subterranean parking with a total of 128 spaces. A number of these spaces will be used as commercial off-street parking during the week. This ancillary use will help manage underutilized parking at the site by providing extra spaces for surrounding uses. The project will include bicycle parking racks to promote the use of diverse means of transportation.
- i. Guiding Principle 6 - Objective 24 - Existing Institutions: Provide long-term opportunities for growth of existing cultural, scientific, corporate, entertainment and educational institutions in balance with their surroundings. Policy 24.1 - Expansion: Recognize and support the expansion opportunities of existing regionally significant cultural, scientific, corporate, entertainment and educational institutions. Policy 24.2 - Land Use Opportunities: Provide land use opportunities to retain and to develop regionally significant cultural, scientific, corporate, entertainment and educational uses. The All Saints Church Master Plan will accommodate the current and future program needs of a significant Pasadena institution. All Saints is a major institutional use which has been located in the Central District for over 100 years. It offers a wide variety of community services. This expansion will allow All Saints Church to have expanded space for worship services, weddings, funerals, counseling, grieving and contemplative prayer as well as provide a child day-care use and a columbarium.

The All Saints Church Master Development Plan EIR (SCH # 2009101073) Land Use Chapter consistency analysis (Impact LUP-1 and General Response #3) is also incorporated herein by reference, which addresses the consistency of the proposed project with the General Plan and Central District Specific Plan.

- 4. The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use in that the proposed master plan continues the establishment, maintenance and operation of an existing cultural institution. The conditions of approval for the master plan ensure that the continued operation of All Saints Church and associated uses would not be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of the inhabitants in the surrounding area. The child day-care center and commercial off-street parking is a benefit to the Civic Center and provide support to surrounding uses. The columbarium will be screened from the street and will not be visible from the hotel.

5. The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City in that the proposed project is the expansion of a religious facility which has been part of this area for over 100 years. Conditions of approval for the restaurant with the walk-up window will minimize any potential impact of that use. The Child Day-care Center will meet all requirements contained in the Zoning Code for open space, parking and hours of operation. The proposed site layout improves the streetscape by employing pedestrian scale elements, includes design features to ensure safe vehicular circulation, and provides publicly accessible open spaces. The site plan organizes program elements around an active, landscaped courtyard, linked to the existing church lawn and city sidewalks. All Saints Church Master Plan also preserves the existing cultural resources (All Saints Church buildings and Maryland Hotel wall).
6. The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection in that the scale of proposed buildings substantially conform with the Central District Specific Plan regulations in terms of height and floor area and incorporates a view corridor to the San Gabriel Mountains along the center of the project. The design of the new structures will be subject to the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings and the Central District Private Realm Design Guidelines and the Sub-District Design Guidelines for the Civic Center, both of which are contained in the Central District Specific Plan. The All Saints Church Master Development Plan EIR (SCH # 2009101073) Aesthetics Chapter (Impacts AES-1, AES-2, and General Response #3) is also incorporated herein by reference, which addresses visual character and mountain views.

II. Conditional Use Permit for a Restaurant with Walk-up Window

The Master Plan proposes a small café of about 800 square feet on the north end of the site. In Phase 1, it would be a small free-standing building with a walk-up window facing the courtyard north of the West Building. In Phase 2, the café will be in the North Building with walk-up window continuing to face the courtyard. The Zoning Code requires a minor conditional use permit for walk-up windows. Staff supports the walk-up window because it will support pedestrians in this area. Because there are no adjacent residential districts within 500 feet of the walk-up window, it will not negatively impact neighboring residents.

7. The proposed use is allowed with a Conditional Use Permit (Major or Minor) or Hillside Development Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code in that a restaurant with a walk-up window is a conditionally permitted use in the CD-2 Subdistrict of the Central District Specific Plan. The proposed use will meet the specific requirements of Section 17.50.260 for restaurants and fast food restaurants, more specifically the requirement that outdoor dining areas shall be defined by landscaping or other barrier as approved by the Zoning Administrator and a requirement that restaurants with a take-out window shall have the business name printed on all disposable containers and napkins.
8. The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district in that the proposed take-out window will be located within the Central District, an area where pedestrian uses are encouraged. The walk-up window would be pedestrian oriented and enhance the

character of the area. More specifically, the purpose of the CD-2 Subdistrict is to strengthen the role as the symbolic and governmental center of the City, supporting civic, cultural, and public service institutions, while augmenting the character of the area with a complementary mixture of uses. The restaurant with a walk-up window supports this purpose as it is a complementary use that will service a series of public uses including the Pasadena City Hall, the County courthouse, the main library, and the police headquarters building.

9. The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan in that the establishment of a restaurant with walk-up window will be a use which will complement the existing institutional uses within the Civic Center. It will encourage pedestrian uses and will promote the Civic Center as a pedestrian focused area. According to the approved Central District Specific Plan, Objective #26, entitled, "Make Downtown Walkable," promotes the downtown as a place to walk, and where walking is the mode of choice for short trips. The restaurant with walk-up window is consistent with this objective.
10. The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use in that the proposed walk-up window will meet the requirements of the Zoning Code requirements in Section 17.50.260 that requires that disposable containers and napkins will have the business name printed on them. The intent of this requirement is to be able to identify whether the trash from a specific restaurant is creating a nuisance. Also, the outdoor dining area will be separated from a barrier from other areas. The intent of this requirement is to ensure that the restaurant does not become larger, and increase the need for additional parking.
11. The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City in that the proposed walk-up window will meet the Zoning Code requirements in Section 17.50.260 that require that disposable containers and napkins will have the business name printed on them. Also, the outdoor dining area will be separated from a barrier from other areas. The intent of requiring a conditional use permit for walk-up windows at a restaurant is to ensure that customers do not loiter and impact adjacent residential uses. There are no residential uses adjacent to the All Saints Church site. The closest residential is north of the site and is about 600 feet away.
12. The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection in that the walk-up window will be low-scale and not be a prominent feature on the site. It will be pedestrian oriented and will be used primarily by visitors to the site, and by employees within the Civic Center area.

III. Minor Conditional Use Permit for Shared Parking

A shared parking study was conducted to determine the demand and need for parking. The study found that the proposed project demand during the weekdays and Saturday is 171 spaces. This parking is provided by 128 on-site underground spaces and 50 parking spaces in the Plaza Las Fuentes garage, which adjoins All Saints Church. Sunday parking demand is 618

spaces and parking demand is met with the 128 on-site spaces and 500 spaces at Plaza Las Fuentes. Additionally the church has 500 spaces available on Sunday in the Kaiser parking structure across Walnut Street. With these spaces, All Saints Church would be able to meet the parking needs on both weekdays and weekends.

This shared parking study also included the use of 50 parking spaces for the purpose of hourly parking for visitors using the adjacent courthouse and other uses within the Civic Center. The applicant has applied for a conditional use permit for the commercial off-street parking use. Thus, even with 50 spaces available to the public, there is sufficient parking for the various uses on the site.

13. The proposed use is allowed with a Conditional Use Permit (Major or Minor) or Hillside Development Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code in that under Section 17.46.050 of the Zoning Code, shared parking requires a minor conditional use permit. This section spells out the requirements for shared parking studies. A study was conducted by Raju Associates and is included as an appendix in the Environmental Impact Report. This study was based on the Urban Land Institute's Shared Parking methodology as recommended by the Zoning Code. The study concluded that the proposed project (with the North Building - Building E) and the use of 50 weekday spaces for public parking is expected to result in weekday peak utilization of 96 percent.
14. The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district in that one of the purposes of this Zoning Code is to provide standards for the orderly development of the City and continue a stable pattern of land uses. The location of this proposed use complies with this purpose as it follows the orderly process for allowing shared parking. It also is consistent with the purpose of the CD-2 - Civic Center/Midtown districts as it will provide additional parking to the district that will be shared with uses and be available for parking for the public.
15. The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan in that shared parking is consistent with Central District Objective #24 which is to "Manage Parking Facilities" and "...emphasizes a shared parking strategy that allows visitors to "park once" and visit many destinations."
16. The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use in that the shared parking study (Alternative 2, Table 18 of the EIR appendix) shows that the parking demand for the site during the week will be 171 spaces and that parking that will be provided will include 128 spaces on-site and 50 spaces at Plaza Las Fuentes for a total of 178 spaces. This demand includes the 50 spaces used for commercial off-street parking. On weekends, the parking demand will be 618 spaces. On weekends, the church has 500 spaces available at the Kaiser parking structure directly across Walnut St. and 500 spaces in the adjacent Plaza Las Fuentes.
17. The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City in that adequate parking will be provided both on-site and off-site. The proposed parking

structure of 128 spaces and the 50 spaces that the church has at Plaza Las Fuentes will ensure that there is adequate parking during the weekdays. Additional parking on the weekends includes 500 spaces at Plaza Las Fuentes and 500 spaces at Kaiser will ensure that as a result of the shared parking there will still be adequate parking and the facility will not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood.

18. The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection in that the shared parking will be located below grade and result in the removal of an unattractive parking lot with limited amounts of landscaping. The operation of the parking structure will be more efficient and the drop-off plan for the children attending the child day-care center will be through the underground parking lot.
19. The spaces to be provided would be available as long as the uses requiring the spaces lawfully exist in that All Saints is constructing 128 parking spaces as a permanent feature of their plan. They also have 50 parking spaces at Plaza Las Fuentes during the week. On weekends they have additional agreements which include 500 parking spaces at Kaiser and 500 parking spaces at Plaza Las Fuentes.
20. The quality and efficiency of the parking or loading utilization would equal or exceed the level that is otherwise required in that the parking will be at least equal in quality and efficiency because the church is constructing additional parking on the site (from 112 spaces to 128 spaces). These spaces will be accessed from Walnut and be located in an underground parking garage. Ingress and egress will be easier for automobiles. The drop off plan for the child day-care center will be through the underground parking structure and not along the street where it could be a potential traffic problem.

IV. Minor Conditional use Permit for Commercial Off-street Parking

21. The proposed use is allowed with a Conditional Use Permit (Major or Minor) or Hillside Development Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code in that the proposed use of 50 of the parking spaces in the parking garage for commercial off-street parking is allowed in CD-2 with the approval of the minor conditional use permit. There are no applicable standards of the Zoning Code related specifically to commercial off-street parking uses.
22. The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district in that the commercial off-street parking area will allow for 50 spaces within the parking garage to be used for commercial parking to service other uses in the Civic Center. During weekdays, the underutilized parking would be used as shared parking with the day-care center and as commercial off-street parking. This will benefit the Civic Center by providing additional parking and by reducing the need for parking elsewhere in the district.
23. The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan in that the establishment of the commercial off-street parking is consistent with Central District Objective #24 which is to "Manage Parking Facilities" and "...emphasizes a shared parking strategy that allows visitors to "park once" and visit many destinations." During

weekdays, the underutilized parking would be used as shared parking with the day-care center and as commercial off-street parking for visitors.

24. The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use in that Commercial off-street parking benefits the surrounding Civic Center Precinct furthers the City's goals to reduce the amount of land area used for parking and efficient use of available parking. The peak traffic periods for All Saints Church occur opposite that of other weekday uses in the Civic Center Precinct. The commercial off-street parking will operate during the weekdays and will not interfere with the use of All Saints on the weekend. The day-care center has operated from the church site without any adverse parking or traffic effects and is a convenient service provided to the community.
25. The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City in that the peak traffic periods for All Saints Church occur opposite that of other weekday uses in the Civic Center Precinct. The day-care center has operated from the church site without any adverse parking or traffic effects and is a convenient service provided to the community. Commercial off-street parking benefits the surrounding Civic Center Precinct and promotes efficient use of available parking. The District-wide site planning guidelines for parking encourage subterranean and structured parking and in particular discourage at-grade parking located at a street corner. This proposal removes an existing parking lot and enhances the Central District by locating the parking in a subterranean garage.
26. The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection in that the commercial off-street parking use will be located in an underground parking garage thus its scale and character are not significant. Its location will not be highly visible and it will not interfere with views.

V. Minor Conditional Use Permit for Tandem Parking Spaces

Even with sufficient parking being proposed, All Saints Church has requested the ability to have 34 tandem parking spaces through the approval of a conditional use permit. This would be tandem parking spaces within the parking garage which would be primarily available on weekends. The Zoning Code allows tandem parking to occur up to a maximum of 75 spaces.

27. The proposed use is allowed with a Conditional Use Permit (Major or Minor) or Hillside Development Permit within the applicable zoning district and complies with all applicable provisions of this Zoning Code in that under Section 17.46.080 of the Zoning Code, tandem parking for nonresidential uses is allowed to a maximum of 75 percent with approval of a minor conditional use permit. The tandem parking will be used primarily for the North Building - Building E when it is constructed.
28. The location of the proposed use complies with the special purposes of this Zoning Code and the purposes of the applicable zoning district in that in that the allowance of the tandem parking is consistent with Section 17.30.020 the purposes of the Central District and in particular the purpose of CD-2 - Civic Center/Midtown. The purpose of CD-2 is to "...strengthen its role as the symbolic and governmental center of the City, supporting

civic, cultural, and public service institutions, while augmenting the character of the area with a complementary mixture of uses.” By allowing tandem parking, All Saints Church will be able to take advantage of its parking garage to park additional automobiles. This supports and strengthens its role as an important institution in the Civic Center area.

29. The proposed use is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan in that in that the establishment of the commercial off-street parking is consistent with the Central District Specific Plan because Objective #24 which is to Manage Parking Facilities “...emphasizes a shared parking strategy that allows visitors to “park once” and visit many destinations.” During weekdays, the underutilized parking would be used as shared parking with the child day-care center and as commercial off-street parking for visitors. The tandem parking spaces will be used primarily to share parking with the North Building - Building E when it is constructed.
30. The establishment, maintenance, or operation of the use would not, under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, or general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood of the proposed use in that the demand for parking is likely to occur on weekends when the Courthouse, City Hall and other public buildings are not in use. Additionally, All Saints has 500 spaces in the adjacent Plaza Las Fuentes garage and 500 spaces in the Kaiser garage across the street that can be used on weekends.
31. The use, as described and conditionally approved, would not be detrimental or injurious to property and improvements in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the City in that the highest demand for parking is likely to occur on weekends when the Courthouse, City Hall and other public buildings are not in use. Additionally, All Saints has 500 spaces in the adjacent Plaza Las Fuentes garage and 500 spaces in the Kaiser garage across the street which can be used on the weekends. The tandem parking spaces will be used primarily for the North Building - Building E and will consist of 34 such spaces. A parking attendant will be on-site when the tandem parking spaces are being utilized so that users can readily exit the parking garage.
32. The design, location, operating characteristics, and size of the proposed use would be compatible with the existing and future land uses in the vicinity in terms of aesthetic values, character, scale, and view protection in that the tandem parking will be located in an underground parking garage and not visible from the street. Thus it will not be incompatible with existing and future land uses in the vicinity.

VI. Variance to Exceed the Maximum Allowed Setback along Euclid Avenue

No rear or interior side yard setbacks are required in the Central District. On Walnut Street and Euclid Avenue buildings are allowed to be set back between zero and five feet from the property lines. The Maryland Hotel Wall is set back two feet from the sidewalk. In order to provide separation from the Maryland Hotel Wall, the south part of the West Building is set back 14 feet, 7 inches from the property line. The north part of the West Building is set back 9 feet, 6 inches. On Walnut Street, a three-foot sidewalk dedication is required and the North Building is set back to align with the hotel. These setbacks require a variance to exceed the maximum setback.

Staff supports these larger setbacks because they align the new buildings with the existing adjacent buildings, allow separation from the Maryland Hotel Wall, and are appropriate for an

institutional use in the Central District. The generous setbacks allow for landscaping between the buildings and the sidewalk, which supports the Central District Specific Plan design guideline of gracious landscape spaces.

A variance is required for the columbarium placement along the rear (east) property line. An outdoor columbarium requires a minimum 20 foot set back from adjoining property lines. Staff supports placement of the columbarium along the interior property line where it would not be visible to the general public, nor the patrons or guests of the abutting hotel. The columbarium complies with the height, landscaping, and screening standards.

33. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the subject site that do not apply generally to sites in the same zoning district in that the historic Maryland Wall runs along the western property line approximately 39 feet north of the rectory. It is setback approximately three feet from the sidewalk. This wall which has a length of 88 feet was part of the Maryland Hotel complex and is historic. It is located as close as two feet from the property line and is about eight feet in height. Preservation of this wall is a significant constraint on the location of the proposed West Building. In order to protect this wall and provide an open space behind the wall, the West Building is set back more than five feet. It will be as close as 9 feet, 6 inches (on the north end) and as far as 14 feet, 7 inches on the south end of the West Building. The All Saints Church rectory and sanctuary are both set back approximately 10-11 feet from the property line. The café and North Building - Building E are proposed to also be set back 10 to 11 feet from the property. The intent here is to have a consistent setback on Euclid for the buildings along this frontage. The current setback requirement of 0 to 5 feet was intended to apply to commercial and mixed use housing projects. It did not anticipate setbacks for institutional uses. It also did not anticipate the need to protect historic resources. Accordingly, the variance is necessary in this instance, and will be consistent with other important institutional buildings in the immediate vicinity. Many of the buildings within the Civic Center have setbacks greater than 5 feet, including City Hall, the Hale Building, the Pasadena Library and the County Courthouse.
34. Granting the application is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right of the applicant and to prevent unreasonable property loss or unnecessary hardship in that without the variance, the Maryland Hotel Wall would have to be demolished in order to construct a building that meets the programmatic needs of All Saints. Since the Maryland Hotel Wall is historically significant, in order to retain the wall, the West Building must be set back more than five feet. Additionally, in order to have an integrated site plan, it is necessary to allow the café building and the North Building - Building E to be set back 9 feet, 6 inches in order to be consistent with the remainder of the blockface.
35. Granting the application would not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the subject site, or to the public health, safety, or general welfare in that the proposed West Building will be set back more than five feet in order to protect and preserve the historic Maryland Wall. This additional setback will not be injurious to adjacent properties or improvements in the vicinity or to the public health, safety, or general welfare because at it closest, the West Building will be 9 feet, 6 inches from the Euclid property line. This continues to meet the intent of the Zoning Code to provide pedestrian access to the building.

36. Granting the application is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan, and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan and the purposes of this Zoning Code, and would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with limitations on other properties in the vicinity and in the same zoning district in that Objective 7 of the Central District Specific Plan states, "Preserve Historic & Cultural Resources." Preservation of the Maryland Hotel Wall is consistent with the intent of the Specific Plan. Setting the West Building Back is necessary to protect the wall. Additionally, the Civic Center/Midtown Sub-District Design Guidelines contained in the Central District Specific Plan specifically calls for the presence of gracious landscape spaces in order to have a strong relationship and comfortable flow between interior and exterior spaces. Increasing the setback allows the project to have additional landscaping which is consistent with this guideline.
37. Cost to the applicant of strict compliance with a regulation shall not be the primary reason for granting the Variance. The reason for granting this variance is because of the location of the historic Maryland Wall which is a constraint on the location of any new building.

VII. Variance to Exceed the Maximum Allowed Setback along Walnut Street

38. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the subject site that do not apply generally to sites in the same zoning district in that the City is requiring that the applicant to dedicate three feet of the Walnut frontage in order to widen the sidewalk. Additionally, in order to have an integrated site plan, it is necessary to allow the café building and the North Building - Building E to be set back 9 feet, 6 inches in order to be consistent with the remainder of the blockface. The proposed North Building - Building E will be set back 13 feet, 2 inches at its farthest.
39. Granting the application is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right of the applicant and to prevent unreasonable property loss or unnecessary hardship in that a greater setback allows the design of the building to be aligned with the building to the east, namely Hutch's Barbeque restaurant and the hotel to the east.
40. Granting the application would not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the subject site, or to the public health, safety, or general welfare in that a greater setback will result in additional landscaping and provide a more aesthetically appealing structure that is aligned with two buildings to the east.
41. Granting the application is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan, and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan and the purposes of this Zoning Code, and would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with limitations on other properties in the vicinity and in the same zone district in that granting this variance will allow for the applicant to have an integrated site plan for the project. Additionally, the Civic Center/Midtown Sub-District Design Guidelines contained in the Central District Specific Plan specifically calls for the presence of gracious landscape spaces in order to have a strong relationship and comfortable flow between interior and exterior spaces. Increasing the setback allows the project to have additional landscaping which is consistent with this guideline.

42. Cost to the applicant of strict compliance with a regulation shall not be the primary reason for granting the Variance. The reason for granting this variance is because of the desire to have an integrated site plan.

VIII. Variance to Allow a Fence along Walnut Street only for the Child Day-Care Use to Exceed the Four-foot Height Limit

The project proposes six-foot tall fences and gates on Euclid Avenue adjacent to the West Building and on Walnut Street east of the driveway. Because there is no North Building in Phase 1 of the project, the six-foot gate on Walnut Street will require a height variance from the four foot maximum height. Staff supports this variance for this small segment in order to provide security for the child day-care use. In the FEIR, Alternative 7 proposed a six foot fence enclosing the landscaped area on the North Building site during Phase 1 of the project. All Saints Church has withdrawn this request, with the exception of the small segment for the child day care use, and the fences in this area will comply with the Zoning Code requirement of four-feet.

43. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the subject site that do not apply generally to sites in the same zoning district in that the child day-care center has an access off of Walnut St. and the need to provide security for the children. Therefore, a six-foot fence adjacent to the eastern property line would be appropriate only for the child day-care center. The child day-care center will be located on the east end of the property adjacent to Walnut. A six-foot fence is needed along the Walnut frontage in order to secure the property from the street and to protect the day-care children. The fence will be setback 13 feet, 2 inches from the sidewalk. The intent of the fence requirement is that a fence should not project in front of buildings. This fence will be in line with Hutch's Barbeque Restaurant.
44. Granting the application is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right of the applicant and to prevent unreasonable property loss or unnecessary hardship in that without the fence variance, All Saints Church will not be able to secure a portion of its property at a point where extra protection is necessary due to the presence of the play area. The intent of the fence is to provide security and protection. It is necessary to provide protection for the children's play area.
45. Granting the application would not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the subject site, or to the public health, safety, or general welfare in that the fence will be limited to six feet, it will be 50 percent open. Its location will not be detrimental to the neighboring property along Walnut Street which is located in close proximity to the street.
46. Granting the application is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan, and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan and the purposes of this Zoning Code, and would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with limitations on other properties in the vicinity and in the same zone district in that the fence variance is for security and protection of the church's property and the protection of the children's play area.
47. Cost to the applicant of strict compliance with a regulation shall not be the primary reason for granting the Variance. The primary reason for granting the variance is to provide a security fence for the child day-care facility.

VIX. Minor Variance for the Construction of a Columbarium within Twenty Feet of a Property Line

48. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the subject site that do not apply generally to sites in the same zoning district in that because of the requirement that columbariums not project beyond the front foot of the religious facility, and the need to create a central courtyard flanked by buildings for the facility, the columbarium has been located on the (east) property line. All Saints Church is bound on the west side by a public street and to the east by a multiple-level hotel. The Forum Building screens the columbarium from the Euclid Avenue street frontage. Placement of the columbarium along the interior property line limits its visibility from the street as well as the hotel property to the northeast, and therefore provides an aesthetic benefit to the rest of the site plan as well as to surrounding views of the site. Other locations were considered but placement of the columbarium elsewhere would result in it being visible from the street or interfering with the child day-care center which is to the north of the Forum Building. The intent of the setback requirement is to protect adjacent uses. Directly to the east of the columbarium location is a courtyard and garden. The columbarium will not be visible from the courtyard or from the hotel.
49. Granting the application is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right of the applicant and to prevent unreasonable property loss or unnecessary hardship in that the columbarium is an essential programmatic element of All Saints Church's operation. Other locations were considered, but placement elsewhere, as a freestanding structure, would make the columbarium more visible from surrounding uses and interfere with the operation of the child day-care center.
50. Granting the application would not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the subject site, or to the public health, safety, or general welfare in that placement of the outdoor columbarium along the interior/rear (east) property line would not be directly visible to the general public, nor patrons or guests of the abutting hotel. The location behind the Forum building screens the columbarium from the street and provided a space that allows for the privacy of visitors. A wall will screen it from the hotel and courtyard on the east.
51. Granting the application is in conformance with the goals, policies, and objectives of the General Plan, and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan and the purposes of this Zoning Code, and would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with limitations on other properties in the vicinity and in the same zone district in that the location of the outdoor columbarium was designed in consideration of the overall site layout and is within a garden setting, in compliance with the height, landscaping, and screening standards. It is located on the eastern end of the site in order for it to be secluded and away from areas where functions regularly occur (such as wedding parties) and the child day-care center.
52. Cost to the applicant of strict compliance with a regulation shall not be the primary reason for granting the Variance. The columbarium is an essential programmatic element of All Saints Church's operations. The proposed location is away from usable areas and the child day-care center. Locating the columbarium adjacent to the east end allows the columbarium to be secluded away from areas of higher activity.

IX. Variance to have Two Loading Spaces on the Street

The Zoning Code requires a minimum of four loading spaces for the expansion of this use. Two existing (tandem) loading spaces are provided on the south side of the sanctuary. The Zoning Code required that loading spaces to be on-site. Because all parking is in the subterranean garage, and in order to create the proposed courtyards and protect the Maryland Hotel Wall, the applicant has proposed to locate the two additional loading spaces on the street along Euclid Ave. which requires a variance. Both the Public Works and Transportation Departments have concurred with this variance request.

The recommendation is to approve the use permit for shared parking as there is a sufficient number to cover both the weekend and weekdays. Additionally, it is recommended that the conditional use permits for the commercial off-street parking use and the tandem parking spaces be approved. Shared parking is consistent with the Central District Specific Plan which emphasizes a shared parking strategy that allows visitors to “park once” and visit many destinations. Finally, it is recommended that the variance to allow the loading spaces on the street be approved. A number of conditions have been recommended to ensure that the parking and loading operate with a minimum of problems.

53. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the subject site that do not apply generally to sites in the same zoning district in that the site currently has two tandem loading spaces located on the south side of the sanctuary. The area on the site north of the sanctuary and rectory consists of a day-care center building and play area followed by a parking lot. The revised project will place all parking in a subterranean garage and minimize driveway entries on Euclid Ave. In order to create various courtyards and protect the Maryland Hotel Wall, it is necessary to have the additional loading spaces on the street. The West Building has been shifted north in order to create a courtyard behind the Maryland Wall and to maintain the open space that currently exists behind the wall. This courtyard is a large area of approximately 10,500 square feet and limits the ability to locate loading on the site.
54. Granting the application is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of a substantial property right of the applicant and to prevent unreasonable property loss or unnecessary hardship in that without the loading variance the parking would have to be located at grade and on site. This would result in the reduction of courtyard areas, and doesn't accommodate the need for a courtyard space behind the Maryland Hotel Wall.
55. Granting the application would not be detrimental or injurious to property or improvements in the vicinity of the subject site or to the public health, safety or general welfare in that sufficient loading will be provided for the use of the building, it just will be located on the street rather than on-site. The loading spaces will be located on Euclid Ave. adjacent to the property making it easy for loading and unloading to occur without disruption. The City had agreed to designate specific loading spaces for this purpose. The street loading zone will meet all City regulations including engineering, transportation, and safety standards.
56. Granting the application is in conformance with the goals, policies and objectives of the General Plan and the purpose and intent of any applicable specific plan and the purposes of this Zoning Code, and would not constitute a grant of special privilege inconsistent with limitations on other properties in the vicinity and in the same zone district in that the site has existing loading spaces located on it. The additional loading

space requirement of the Zoning Code will be met, they spaces will not be on-site but adjacent to the property on the street.

57. Cost to the applicant of strict compliance with the regulation should not be the primary reason for granting the Variance because the cost to the applicant has not been considered the primary factor at any time throughout the review of this application. The variance is needed in order to meet the Zoning requirements. The site has two existing loading spaces located on the south side of the sanctuary. Loading cannot be accommodated in the underground parking garage because of the site narrows down on the north end of the site (from 200 feet wide to 120 feet wide) making it difficult for trucks to turn around inside the garage.