

CITY OF PASADENA  
City Council Minutes  
October 29, 2007 – 5:00 P.M.  
City Hall Council Chamber

SPECIAL MEETING

**OPENING:**

Mayor Bogaard called the special meeting to order at 5:02 p.m.  
(Absent: Councilmember Madison)

On order of the Mayor, the special meeting recessed at 5:03 p.m., to discuss the following closed sessions:

Councilmember Madison  
arrived at 5:32 p.m.

**CITY COUNCIL CONFERENCE REGARDING PUBLIC  
EMPLOYMENT pursuant to Government Code Section  
54957**

**Title: City Manager**

The above closed session item was discussed, with no reportable action at this time.

On order of the Mayor, the special meeting reconvened at 7:09 p.m. The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Councilmember Madison.

**ROLL CALL:**

Councilmembers:

Mayor Bill Bogaard  
Vice Mayor Steve Haderlein  
Councilmember Victor Gordo  
Councilmember Chris Holden  
Councilmember Steve Madison  
Councilmember Margaret McAustin  
Councilmember Jacque Robinson  
Councilmember Sidney F. Tyler

Staff:

City Manager Cynthia Kurtz  
City Attorney Michele Beal Bagneris  
Senior Assistant City Clerk Mark Jomsky

**CEREMONIAL MATTERS**

Councilmember Tyler introduced a delegation of five Russian social service professionals visiting Pasadena. Margaret Duncan-Abrams, Pasadena Rotary Club, provided a brief description regarding the purpose of the delegation's visit to Pasadena as part of the Open World Program. Mayor Bogaard welcomed and presented gifts to each member of the delegation.

**PUBLIC COMMENT LIMITED  
TO ITEMS ON THE SPECIAL  
MEETING AGENDA**

Mayor Bogaard introduced the public comment portion of the special meeting. Pursuant to the advice provided by the City Attorney, the City Council agreed by consensus to limit individual comments to two minutes in length due to the large number of public comment requests.

Mr. Ken Hardy, Chair of the Human Relation Commission, reviewed the report submitted to the City Council. He commented on the alleged human rights violations occurring in China and the impact this had on public perception regarding the submission of a float commemorating the Beijing Olympics in the 2008 Rose Parade. He also reviewed the City's role in addressing international matters, past actions taken by the Council in support of human rights, and the appropriateness of the City to take a stance when it comes to human rights issues. He concluded by reviewing the recommendations of the report recognizing the principals of human rights, encouraging the improvement of human rights in China, and facilitating a dialogue between protestors and supporters of the float in order to reach a resolution to the issue.

Mr. Hardy responded to questions regarding the recommendations of the Human Relations Commission, potential language for a resolution addressing human rights issues, the appropriateness of the City to respond to this particular issue, and examples of past City Council actions to address human rights violations.

Mr. Fred Alcantar, President of the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee, provided an overview of the Sister City Program and mission statement. He also stated the Committee's opposition to local government entities responding to human rights issues with the more appropriate response coming from the Federal level through the elected representatives in Congress.

The following persons expressed concerns regarding alleged human rights violations occurring in China and the inclusion of a float commemorating the Beijing Olympics in the 2008 Rose Parade:

Bob McCloskey, Monterey Park resident, submitted informational materials  
Theresa Marie Moreau, La Crescenta resident  
Joe Brown, Pasadena resident  
Felipe O. Infante, Pasadena resident  
Leslie Levy, Pasadena resident, submitted a poem  
Zavon Brown, Pasadena resident  
Bei Ling, Boston, Massachusetts resident  
John Li, Caltech Falun Gong Club representative, submitted informational materials

Yosh Yamanaka, Marina Del Rey resident, submitted informational materials  
Shishong Chen, Conscience Foundation representative  
Bin Li, Rowland Heights resident  
Yaning Liu, Baldwin Park resident, submitted informational materials  
Lisa Hart, Los Angeles County Human Relations Commission representative  
Maxine Russell, Justice for Americans in China representative, submitted informational materials  
Philip Watt, Los Angeles resident, submitted informational materials  
Jie Li, Pasadena resident  
Aaron Proctor, Pasadena resident  
John Wills, Pasadena resident  
Seten Phanucharas, Los Angeles Friends of Tibet representative, submitted informational materials  
Hongwei Lou, Rowland Heights resident  
Fengling Ge, Rowland Heights resident  
Bobby Wang, Baldwin Park resident, submitted informational materials  
George Moo, Pasadena resident  
Ann Lau, Visual Artists Guild representative  
Quinghua Wang, Pasadena resident  
Jim Lomako, Pasadena resident, submitted a written statement

The following persons spoke in support of the participation of the float commemorating the Beijing Olympics in the 2008 Rose Parade:

Gregory Schuster, University of Redlands, Government & Business in China Class representative  
Inman Moore, Pasadena resident  
Alan Lamson, Pasadena Sister Cities representative  
Fred Soldwedel, Pasadena resident, submitted informational materials  
Elmer Christensen, Montrose resident  
Jane Hallinger, Pasadena Sister Cities representative  
Roselyn Elliott, Pasadena Sister Cities representative  
Hudson Warren, Pasadena resident

#### **DISCUSSION AND POTENTIAL ACTION ON HUMAN RELATIONS COMMISSION REPORT REGARDING HUMAN RIGHTS AND 2008 ROSE PARADE FLOAT COMMEMORATING BEIJING OLYMPICS**

Following public comment, in initiating City Council discussion, the Mayor expressed his sympathy and concern regarding human rights abuses throughout the world, stated his respect for the many views presented to the Council, read excerpts from a letter from the Tournament of Roses dated October 26,

2007 explaining the Tournament's acceptance of the entry of the float in the 2008 Rose Parade commemorating the Beijing Olympics, and stated his support regarding the float entry based on its Olympic theme and the values of the global tradition of athletic competition represented by the Olympic Games. The Mayor concluded by stating that, having conferred with the City Attorney and having no economic conflict or prejudged bias in relation to this issue, his participation in the debate surrounding the float is not only appropriate but also part of his responsibility as an elected official.

Vice Mayor Haderlein read additional excerpts of the letter from the Tournament of Roses emphasizing that the theme of the float promotes the Olympic games and is in accordance with the 2008 Rose Parade theme, "Passport to the World's Celebrations."

Vice Mayor Haderlein suggested that the City Council support the inclusion of the float commemorating the Beijing Olympics in the 2008 Rose Parade, and to convene an ad hoc committee, similar to the recommendation by the Human Relations Commission, with the purpose of the Committee being to craft a statement regarding the City's position on human rights issues, direct that the statement be communicated to the City's sister cities and others, and include in the ad hoc committee membership Inman Moore and Alan Lamson. He further clarified that the purpose of the ad hoc committee was slightly different than what was outlined in the recommendation of the Human Relations Commission report, stating that the Human Relations Commission would be more appropriate in organizing a dialogue with the various parties regarding the Rose Parade float issue and that the ad hoc committee would be charged with crafting a more general statement of the City's position regarding human rights issues.

Councilmember Madison expressed his concerns in forming a committee to study human rights issues outside the scope of Pasadena, and also in taking an action that would single out the City's support of a lone float entry in the 2008 Rose Parade, rather than just expressing general support for the Tournament of Roses and the Rose Parade.

Following discussion, the City Council agreed by consensus to decline to take any action or position with respect to the entry of 2008 Rose Parade float commemorating the Beijing Olympics.

Following further discussion regarding the creation of an ad hoc committee, Vice Mayor Haderlein suggested that a joint meeting of the Human Relations Commission and the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee may be more appropriate for the purpose of crafting a statement on behalf of the City regarding human rights issues.

Councilmember Madison raised concerns regarding the scope of the action under consideration by the City Council and whether it would impact such areas as the City's investment policies or interaction with other levels of government.

Councilmember Holden spoke in support of the creation of a resolution voicing the City's opposition to human rights violations, the appropriateness of the City Council to make such statements, and the importance of utilizing the current situation and the City's established relationship with the Sister Cities Program in encouraging dialogue and support of human rights in China. He also stated his support for the creation of an ad hoc committee to create a forum that encourages a broader dialogue regarding human rights issues, as well as charging the Human Relations Commission with the task of crafting a resolution addressing human rights violations, to return within 30 days for City Council consideration.

The Mayor distributed a handout to the City Council entitled, A Universal Declaration of Human Rights adopted by the United Nations on December 10, 1948, which he stated is a broad and comprehensive statement advocating human rights. He suggested that the City Council consider endorsing the United Nations resolution as the Council's commitment to human rights rather than creating an ad hoc committee charged with crafting a new statement. The Mayor also suggested that the City Council consider taking an informal action recognizing December 10<sup>th</sup> as a Day of Human Rights. This informal action would not include the use of City resources or funding but would encourage the creation of a celebration honoring the adoption of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights by the United Nations, which could then be supported by Councilmembers on an individual basis and coordinated by such entities as the Pasadena Chapter of the United Nations Association, local businesses, and interested members of the community to be held on December 10<sup>th</sup> of each year.

Councilmember Madison suggested that the City Council endorse and support the values reflected in the United Nations' Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and direct the Human Relations Commission and the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee to then implement the endorsement in a manner deemed appropriate, which may include returning to Council with additional recommendations.

Vice Mayor Haderlein suggested an alternative action would be to have the Council direct the Human Relations Commission to review the proposed action of endorsing the United Nations Declaration and determine if such an action is appropriate, and return with a recommendation at the City Council meeting on December 10, 2007 for formal action. Following the City Council's formal action, the Human Relations Commission would then be asked to provide suggestions at a future meeting regarding implementation of the Council's actions.

Councilmember Madison expressed concern with the City Council taking action at a future meeting and reopening the issue for further public comment.

Councilmember Gordo encouraged the City Council to take action to endorse the United Nations Declaration, to denounce the violation of human rights wherever they occur, and to direct the ad hoc committee to provide a recommendation to the City Council on how to best communicate this message to the City's sister cities. He acknowledged the complexity in addressing the issue but expressed his opinion that the intent of the Sister Cities Program was to encourage exchange of ideas and communication.

Councilmember McAustin commended the Human Relations Commission on the preparation and work put into the report received by the City Council. She suggested that the Council forgo the creation of an ad hoc committee but instead direct the Human Relations Commission, in conjunction with the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee, to draft and develop a resolution for City Council adoption within 30 days utilizing the language from the United Nations Declaration of Human Rights, and to provide a recommendation on how best to communicate this message in a positive manner to the City's sister cities.

Discussion ensued regarding the suggestions made by Councilmembers and how best to proceed.

Following discussion, Councilmember Madison stated his support for endorsing the United Nations declaration and allowing the Human Relations Commission to meet and discuss such issues as how this endorsement might impact the City's current sister cities relationships or other areas of municipal services.

Councilmember Gordo encouraged the Council to take the following actions:

- (1) Denounce human rights violations wherever they occur.
- (2) Adopt the Universal Declaration of Human Rights as approved by the United Nations on December 10, 1948.

- (3) Direct the Human Relations Commission to work with the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee on providing recommendations on how best to communicate this action to the City's sister cities.

Councilmember Holden spoke on the issues raised specifically related to China, and stated his support for the Human Relations Commission to draft resolution language that not only addresses human rights issues but directly addresses the issues raised regarding China in order to be completely responsive to the questions, issues, concerns, and public testimony received by the Human Relations Commission and the Council, and to receive this resolution within 30 days for final action by the Council. He also stated his support for the Human Relations Commission's recommendation for broadening this into a more general discussion of human rights issues utilizing an ad hoc committee to facilitate this action.

The Mayor suggested that the initial action of the Council be to endorse the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. He also suggested that the dissemination of this message include distribution to Congressman Adam Schiff, Senator Diane Feinstein, Senator Barbara Boxer, representatives in the State Department that deal with China on a daily basis, and the five Consul Generals of the countries with whom the City of Pasadena has a sister city relationship.

Following discussion, it was moved by Vice Mayor Haderlein, seconded by Councilmember Tyler, to endorse, in principle, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights as approved by the United Nations on December 10, 1948. (Motion unanimously carried) (Absent: None)

It was moved by Vice Mayor Haderlein, seconded by Councilmember Gordo, to denounce human rights violations wherever they occur. (Motion unanimously carried) (Absent: None)

There was discussion on whether to allow the Human Relations Commission and the Pasadena Sister Cities Committee the opportunity to provide input on how and when the adopted actions would be communicated, the timing regarding the actions taken, the necessity for further deliberations, and the need to include specific language related to the issues raised regarding China.

Following discussion, it was agreed by consensus that the transmittal letter emphasize that the actions taken by the City Council to endorse the Universal Declaration of Human Rights as approved by the United Nations, and to denounce human rights violations wherever they occur, were prompted by public testimony received by the Human Relations Commission and the City Council regarding human rights violations occurring in China.

Following discussion, it was moved by Vice Mayor Haderlein, seconded by Councilmember Gordo, to communicate the actions of the City Council to Congressman Adam Schiff, Senator Diane Feinstein, Senator Barbara Boxer, representatives in the State Department that deal with China, the five Consul Generals of the countries with whom the City of Pasadena has a sister city relationship, as well directly with representatives of the City's sister cities, and to include in the transmittal letter the reasons for the City Council action regarding human rights issues as a response to public testimony received regarding violations of human rights in China. (Motion unanimously carried) (Absent: None)

Councilmember Holden stated the need to further address the issues raised regarding the human rights violations occurring in China and that a statement of the City should directly address those issues, rather than a general statement advocating human rights.

Following discussion, it was moved by Councilmember Holden, seconded by Councilmember Robinson, to direct the Human Relations Commission to utilize the United Nations declaration as a template for crafting a specific resolution addressing the human rights violations that are occurring in China, extract language specific to the violations the City Council believes are occurring in China, and the change that the Council encourages China to make in order to address these human rights issues, and to direct the Human Relations Commission to come back to the City Council in 30 days with a resolution incorporating these general principals.

AYES: Councilmembers Holden, Robinson

NOES: Councilmembers Gordo, Madison, McAustin, Tyler,  
Vice Mayor Haderlein, Mayor Bogaard

ABSENT: None

(Motion Failed)

As a point of clarification, the Mayor, with the consensus of the City Council, agreed to draft the transmittal letter and to informally share it with the City Council in order to ensure that it is consistent with the Council's intended action.



Following discussion related to the report submitted by the Human Relations Commission, it was moved by Councilmember Tyler, seconded by Councilmember McAustin, to receive the Human Relations Commission report regarding human rights issues and the 2008 Rose Parade float commemorating the Beijing Olympics, expressing congratulations and gratitude for the extensive work that was done in preparing and submitting the report to the City Council. (Motion unanimously carried) (Absent: None)

Councilmember Madison was excused at 10:45 p.m.

The Mayor stated that a letter would be prepared and forwarded to the Human Relations Commission expressing the sentiments of the City Council.

**ADJOURNMENT**

On order of the Mayor, the regular meeting of the City Council adjourned at 10:47 p.m.



\_\_\_\_\_  
Bill Bogaard, Mayor  
City of Pasadena

ATTEST:

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
City Clerk